

United Jewish Communities

Live Generously.™ It does a world of good.

Gender-Related Distribution of Federation Professional Positions in 2004

Research Report by: Professor Steven M. Cohen The Hebrew University

On Behalf of the: Gender Equity & Organizational Effectiveness Team Chaired by Terry Meyerhoff Rubenstein

A Partnership of: Advancing Women Professionals and The Jewish Community and United Jewish Communities Page 1

Context and Background

A large and comprehensive body of research over the last decade and more has documented two sorts of gender-related disparities in the work place. First, men more frequently than women achieve sought-after positions, those marked by higher prestige, influence, visibility, and financial reward. Second, when men and women occupy seemingly comparable positions in the work force, men obtain higher levels of compensation than women. These patterns of gender-related disparity apply not only to the labor force in general; they also apply to professions such as law, academia, medicine, finance, science, and technology.

Not surprisingly, the patterns extend to Jewish communal life as well. One recent study of Conservative rabbis ordained since 1985 documents the two classic disparities (Cohen and Schor 2004). Fewer women than men occupy the most prestigious positions in the Conservative rabbinate (spiritual leaders of larger congregations). Moreover, men and women rabbis in similar positions (e.g., spiritual leaders of middle-sized congregations) report clear differentials with respect to monetary compensation and benefits, with men's compensation substantially exceeding that of their female counterparts. A study of JCC professionals demonstrates similar gender-related disparities in compensation for high-level professionals in the Center movement (Schor and Cohen 2002).

Preliminary examination of the federation movement through interviews with lay and professional leadership around the country uncovered evidence, albeit largely of a qualitative nature, of gender bias in the employment of women professionals (Cohen, Bronznick, et al. 2004). The study noted the absence of women from the top ranks of federation professional leadership (directors of the largest federations), accompanied with a steady *increase in* the proportion female as one moved *down* the professional hierarchy at that time, from executives of large federations (0%), to executives of large-intermediate federations (16%), to associate executives of the largest federations (28%), and to the associate executives of intermediate sized federations (47%).

Objectives of this analysis

Building upon the earlier report, AWP and UJC committed themselves to working toward an ongoing research and monitoring system to regularly assess the status of women professionals in the federation system. Accordingly, this paper seeks to expand upon the previous work of the AWP-UJC partnership to take a more detailed look at gender variations in placement among federation professionals, throughout the United States and Canada. We hope to learn how gender is currently related to placement and promotion. This report aims to set the groundwork for an ongoing data collection and analysis system that will monitor, track, analyze, and report on changes on the status of women and men professionals in federations throughout North America. Specifically, the analysis below seeks to answer the following question: How are men and women distributed by professional status? In other words, who holds which jobs?

While the analysis covers the entire population of professionals, it also focuses upon high-status professionals (as defined below, these make up less than a quarter of all positions in the system). We seek to test the possibility that patterns applicable to the high-status positions may well not characterize the entire population. Perhaps, in line with studies of professionals elsewhere, impediments to women's advancement are especially pronounced in the upper ranks.

The Data: The UJC Annual Personnel Survey

The analysis below draws upon the annual UJC survey of personnel. UJC's Mandel Center for Leadership Excellence collects personnel data annually from its member federations across the continent (United States and Canada). Generally, a single official at each federation (e.g., executive, CFO, or personnel director) completes the survey on all local federation communal professionals. The data set we were provided includes information from 103 communities on 1,748 federation professionals in North America from 2004, excluding UJA/Federation of New York. New York has been dropped from this analysis due to an incomplete data set. [See addendum for a full listing of positions and the percentage of women in each.]

The variables in the UJC data set drawn for this analysis consist of the following:

- City code
- Size of community
- Job title (the actual title of the job as is used at the particular federation)
- Job code (a three-digit code assigned by UJC data entry professionals to similarsounding job titles)
- Gender

Job Titles in the Federation System

Preliminary to the statistical analysis, the chart below, listing dozens of job titles, provides a basic orientation to the scope and complexity of the jobs found throughout the federation system.

JOB TITLES

JOB TITLE	JOB TITLE
EXECUTIVE VP/DIRECTOR	MISSIONS DIRECTOR
ASSOCIATE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR	ASSOC/ASST MISSIONS DIRECTOR
ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR	MISSIONS STAFF
COO	WOMEN'S DIVISION DIRECTOR
SPECIAL ASSISTANT TO PRESIDENT	ASSOCIATE WOMEN'S DIVISION DIR
PERSONNEL DIRECTOR	ASSISTANT WOMEN'S DIVISION DIR
ASSISTANT PERSONNEL DIR	WOMEN'S DIVISION ASSOCIATE
OFFICE MANAGER	ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR
PLANNING DIRECTOR	ASSOCIATE ENDOWMENT DIR
ASSOCIATE PLANNING DIR	ASSISTANT ENDOWMENT DIR
ASSISTANT PLANNING DIR	SR. ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATE
SR. PLANNING ASSOCIATE	ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATE
PLANNING ASSOCIATE	CRC DIRECTOR
MARKETING DIR	ASSOCIATE CRC DIRECTOR
ASSOCIATE MARKETING DIR	ASSISTANT CRC DIRECTOR
ASSISTANT MARKETING DIR	CRC ASSOCIATE
SR. MARKETING ASSOCIATE	LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT DIR
MARKETING ASSOCIATE	ASSOC LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT DIR
FRD DIRECTOR	ASST LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT DIR
ASSOCIATE/ASSISTANT FRD DIR	LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATE
FRD ASSOCIATE	YLD
CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR	HRD DIRECTOR
ASSOCIATE CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR	ASSOCIATE HRD DIRECTOR
ASSISTANT CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR	ASSISTANT HRD DIRECTOR
MAJOR GIFTS DIRECTOR	HRD ASSOCIATE
DIVISION DIRECTOR	REFUGEE RESETTLEMENT DIR/COORD
ASSOC/ASST DIVISION DIRECTOR	REFUGEE RESETTLEMENT STAFF
REGIONAL DIRECTOR	JEWISH EDUCATION DIR/COORD
ASSOC/ASST REGIONAL DIRECTOR	JEWISH EDUCATION ASSOCIATE
SR. CAMPAIGN ASSOCIATE	PROGRAM DIRECTOR
CAMPAIGN ASSOCIATE	PROGRAM ASSOCIATE
SR. MAJOR GIFTS OFFICER	RESEARCH DIRECTOR
MAJOR GIFTS ASSOCIATE	DIRECTOR MIS
CFO	ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR MIS
ASSOCIATE CFO	MIS STAFF
ASSISTANT CFO	WEBMASTER
OTHER FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL	OTHER PROFESSIONAL STAFF
CONTROLLER	

Men and Women in Various Jobs

For only a few job titles do men exceed women in number, as women constitute nearly 70% of the total federation professional work force. Among the male-dominated job titles are: executive vice president/executive director, associate executive director and financial resource development director.

Women constitute the majority in all other job titles, and in some titles women are especially numerous. The positions with especially high proportions of female incumbents consist of the following: office manager, planning associate, division director (a mid-level campaign position), women's division director, endowment associate, Jewish education associate, program director, and program associate. Women dominate in entry-level or associate level positions.

At the same time, we find a near even gender balance in several high ranking positions such as chief financial officer, endowment director and chief operating officer.

Percent Female by Job Title, For Eight Highest Level Jobs					
	%	Total			
Job Title	Female	Jobs			
EXECUTIVE VP/DIRECTOR	31	153			
ASSOCIATE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/COO	44	34			
ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR	54	37			
CFO	50	50			
FRD DIRECTOR	33	15			
ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR	51	35			
CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR	67	45			
PLANNING DIRECTOR	65	31			

Gender Distribution for the Highest-Ranking Jobs, by City Size

Both job title and city size need to be considered simultaneously in order to understand the nature of gender distribution in the federation system. Accordingly, we examine the gender distributions focusing specifically upon the higher-ranking jobs in the federation system, disaggregated by city size.

These higher-ranking jobs may be divided into eight categories:

- 1) Executive vice president or comparable titles for the federation CEO.
- 2) Associate executive vice president, COO or similar titles.
- 3) Assistant executive vice president.
- 4) Chief financial officer
- 5) FRD director
- 6) Endowment director
- 7) Campaign director
- 8) Planning director

Percent of Job Incumbents Who are Female (by Type of Job and City Size)

CITY SIZE

	Lar	Large		Large/ Intermediate		Intermediate		Small		Total	
Job Title	% Female	Total Jobs	% Female	Total Jobs	% Female	Total Jobs	% Female	Total Jobs	% Female	Total Jobs	
Execs		19*		18**				61		152	
LAGUS	0%	19	17%	10	20%	54	54%	01	31%	152	
Associate Execs, COOs	41%	17	14%	7	70%	10	n/a	n/a	44%	34	
Asst Execs	31%	16	73%	11	83%	6	50%	4	54%	37	
CFOs	35%	17	50%	10	59%	22	100%	1	50%	50	
FRD Director	50%	2	20%	5	29%	7	100%	1	33%	15	
Endowment Director	40%	10	33%	9	67%	15	100%	1	51%	35	
Campaign Director	53%	15	80%	10	67%	18	100%	2	67%	45	
Planning Directors	59%	17	73%	11	67%	3	n/a	n/a	65%	31	
Other Professionals	73%	872	77%	218	82%	222	82%	57	76%	1369	
Total	69%	1017	69%	303	71%	342	76%	87	70%	1768	

^{*}There are 20 Large City federations: one community has an acting Director not included in analysis.

^{**}There are 19 Large/Intermediate City federations: one community has an acting Director not included in analysis.

Women constitute approximately 70% of the entire professional work force in Jewish federations. However, their presence is far from evenly distributed by job and Jewish community size.

Thus, among the executives, the most senior position in the system, the proportion female **increases** sharply with **decreases** in city size. Specifically, with respect to the proportion female among chief executives, their number moves from 0% in the 20 Large cities included in the sample, to 17% in the Large Intermediate cities, to 20% in communities of Intermediate size, to 54% in the smallest communities.

60% 54% 50% 40% Percentage 31% 30% 20% 17% 20% 10% 0% 0% Large Large/Intermediate Intermediate Small Total **City Size**

Percentage Female Chief Executives

At the same time, the gender distributions point to some intriguing patterns. Women constitute about half of the high-ranking professionals other than the executives, and about three-quarters of the other professionals. (For these purposes, high-ranking professionals here refers to such positions as associate executive, senior fund-raisers, planning directors, CFOs, etc.).

It is striking that there are a relatively large number of women serving in what are in effect the "number 2" positions in the largest communities. In such communities, women are 41% of associate executives, and 31% of assistant executives. This pattern is all the more noteworthy in light of women's total absence among the most senior positions in such federations.

We can only speculate as to the reasons for this discrepancy, but, perhaps the absence of women from the lead positions in the large communities has made them more competitive for the sub-executive posts, either because of their availability in the requisite talent pool, or because the executives (who generally make the appointments of their associates) seek gender diversity in their communities' top leadership ranks.

Page 7

Summing up through the lens of city size, women are under-represented in a small number of job titles relative to their proportions among all federation professionals, and even relative to their proportions among middle- and lower-ranking professionals, as follows:

- 1) Executives of large, large-intermediate, and intermediate size communities.
- 2) Associate executives of large and large-intermediate size communities.

In other positions, women generally account for one half to three quarters of the professional staff, with little systematic variation by community size.

Looking Forward

With these analyses in place, we can then analyze data collected in future years to learn of changes in all the issues alluded to above and more. Thus, we will be able to establish procedures that can understand, and portray year-to-year changes in gender variations in status and promotion in the federation system.

ADDENDUM

Percent Female by Job Title, Throughout the Federation System				
	%	Total		
Job Title	Female	Jobs		
DIRECTOR MIS	22	23		
EXECUTIVE VP/DIRECTOR	25	89		
FRD DIRECTOR	33	15		
ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR MIS	33	15		
WEBMASTER	33	6		
MIS STAFF	38	52		
ASSOCIATE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR	40	25		
SENIOR MAJOR GIFTS OFFICER	50	6		
CFO	50	50		
ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR	51	35		
ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR	54	37		
ASSOCIATE CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR	55	11		
coo	56	9		
SR. MARKETING ASSOCIATE	57	14		
FRD ASSOCIATE	57	7		
ASSOCIATE ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR	58	19		
ASSOCIATE-ASSISTANT FRD DIR	60	5		
PLANNING DIRECTOR	65	31		
ASSISTANT CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR	65	17		
ASSISTANT PLANNING DIRECTOR	67	12		
CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR	67	45		
SR ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATE	67	33		
MARKETING DIRECTOR	68	47		
OTHER PROFESSIONAL STAFF	68	158		
ASSOCIATE PLANNING DIRECTOR	70	10		
ASSOCIATE MARKETING DIRECTOR	70	10		
OTHER FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL	70	104		
CONTROLLER	70	43		
CRC DIRECTOR	70	37		
MARKETING ASSOCIATE	75	52		
MAJOR GIFTS DIRECTOR	75	12		
JEWISH EDUCATION DIR-COORD	76	25		
PERSONNEL DIRECTOR	78	9		

Percent Female by Job Title, Throughout the Federation System					
	%	Total			
Job Title	Female	Jobs			
ASSISTANT ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR	78	18			
CRC ASSOCIATE	79	19			
PLANNING ASSOCIATE	80	20			
REGIONAL DIRECTOR	80	10			
DIVISION DIRECTOR	81	31			
CAMPAIGN ASSOCIATE	81	115			
PROGRAM DIRECTOR	81	70			
HRD DIRECTOR	82	11			
ASSISTANT MARKETING DIRECTOR	83	12			
LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR	85	13			
ASSOCIATE CFO	86	7			
SR. CAMPAIGN ASSOCIATE	88	51			
ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATE	88	25			
PROGRAM ASSOCIATE	88	51			
SR. PLANNING ASSOCIATE	91	22			
JEWISH EDUCATION ASSOCIATE	91	46			
WOMENS DIVISION ASSOCIATE	94	18			
OFFICE MANAGER	96	24			
WOMENS DIVISION DIRECTOR	98	42			
SPECIAL ASSISTANT TO PRESIDENT	100	6			
ASSISTANT PERSONNEL DIR	100	4			
ASSOC-ASST REGIONAL DIRECTOR	100	5			
ASSISTANT CFO	100	5			
ASSISTANT WOMENS DIVISION DIR	100	7			
ASSOCIATE CRC DIRECTOR	100	4			
ASSISTANT CRC DIRECTOR	100	4			
YLD	100	9			
ASSISTANT HRD DIRECTOR	100	4			
HRD ASSOCIATE	100	12			
OTHER	95	19			
Total	70	1749			