## United Jewish Communities

Live Generously. ${ }^{T M}$ It does a world of good.
AND THE JEWISH COMMUNITY

# Gender-Related Distribution of Federation Professional Positions in 2004 

Research Report by:
Professor Steven M. Cohen
The Hebrew University

On Behalf of the:
Gender Equity \& Organizational Effectiveness Team
Chaired by Terry Meyerhoff Rubenstein

A Partnership of:
Advancing Women Professionals and The Jewish Community and
United Jewish Communities

## Context and Background

A large and comprehensive body of research over the last decade and more has documented two sorts of gender-related disparities in the work place. First, men more frequently than women achieve sought-after positions, those marked by higher prestige, influence, visibility, and financial reward. Second, when men and women occupy seemingly comparable positions in the work force, men obtain higher levels of compensation than women. These patterns of gender-related disparity apply not only to the labor force in general; they also apply to professions such as law, academia, medicine, finance, science, and technology.

Not surprisingly, the patterns extend to Jewish communal life as well. One recent study of Conservative rabbis ordained since 1985 documents the two classic disparities (Cohen and Schor 2004). Fewer women than men occupy the most prestigious positions in the Conservative rabbinate (spiritual leaders of larger congregations). Moreover, men and women rabbis in similar positions (e.g., spiritual leaders of middlesized congregations) report clear differentials with respect to monetary compensation and benefits, with men's compensation substantially exceeding that of their female counterparts. A study of JCC professionals demonstrates similar gender-related disparities in compensation for high-level professionals in the Center movement (Schor and Cohen 2002).

Preliminary examination of the federation movement through interviews with lay and professional leadership around the country uncovered evidence, albeit largely of a qualitative nature, of gender bias in the employment of women professionals (Cohen, Bronznick, et al. 2004). The study noted the absence of women from the top ranks of federation professional leadership (directors of the largest federations), accompanied with a steady increase in the proportion female as one moved down the professional hierarchy at that time, from executives of large federations (0\%), to executives of largeintermediate federations (16\%), to associate executives of the largest federations (28\%), and to the associate executives of intermediate sized federations (47\%).

## Objectives of this analysis

Building upon the earlier report, AWP and UJC committed themselves to working toward an ongoing research and monitoring system to regularly assess the status of women professionals in the federation system. Accordingly, this paper seeks to expand upon the previous work of the AWP-UJC partnership to take a more detailed look at gender variations in placement among federation professionals, throughout the United States and Canada. We hope to learn how gender is currently related to placement and promotion. This report aims to set the groundwork for an ongoing data collection and analysis system that will monitor, track, analyze, and report on changes on the status of women and men professionals in federations throughout North America. Specifically, the analysis below seeks to answer the following question: How are men and women distributed by professional status? In other words, who holds which jobs?

While the analysis covers the entire population of professionals, it also focuses upon high-status professionals (as defined below, these make up less than a quarter of all positions in the system). We seek to test the possibility that patterns applicable to the high-status positions may well not characterize the entire population. Perhaps, in line with studies of professionals elsewhere, impediments to women's advancement are especially pronounced in the upper ranks.

## The Data: The UJC Annual Personnel Survey

The analysis below draws upon the annual UJC survey of personnel. UJC's Mandel Center for Leadership Excellence collects personnel data annually from its member federations across the continent (United States and Canada). Generally, a single official at each federation (e.g., executive, CFO, or personnel director) completes the survey on all local federation communal professionals. The data set we were provided includes information from 103 communities on 1,748 federation professionals in North America from 2004, excluding UJA/Federation of New York. New York has been dropped from this analysis due to an incomplete data set. [See addendum for a full listing of positions and the percentage of women in each.]

The variables in the UJC data set drawn for this analysis consist of the following:

- City code
- Size of community
- Job title (the actual title of the job as is used at the particular federation)
- Job code (a three-digit code assigned by UJC data entry professionals to similarsounding job titles)
- Gender


## Job Titles in the Federation System

Preliminary to the statistical analysis, the chart below, listing dozens of job titles, provides a basic orientation to the scope and complexity of the jobs found throughout the federation system.

JOB TITLES

|  |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| JOB TITLE | JOB TITLE |
| EXECUTIVE VP/DIRECTOR | ASSOCIASSIRECTOR |
| ASSOCIATE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR | MISSIONS STAFF |
| ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR | WOMEN'S DIVISION DIRECTOR |
| COO | ASSOCIATE WOMEN'S DIVISION DIR |
| SPECIAL ASSISTANT TO PRESIDENT | ASSISTANT WOMEN'S DIVISION DIR |
| PERSONNEL DIRECTOR | WOMEN'S DIVISION ASSOCIATE |
| ASSISTANT PERSONNEL DIR | ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR |
| OFFICE MANAGER | ASSOCIATE ENDOWMENT DIR |
| PLANNING DIRECTOR | ASSISTANT ENDOWMENT DIR |
| ASSOCIATE PLANNING DIR | SR. ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATE |
| ASSISTANT PLANNING DIR | ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATE |
| SR. PLANNING ASSOCIATE | ASSOCIATE CRC DIRECTOR |
| PLANNING ASSOCIATE | ASSISTANT CRC DIRECTOR |
| MARKETING DIR | CRC ASSOCIATE |
| ASSOCIATE MARKETING DIR | LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT DIR |
| ASSISTANT MARKETING DIR | ASSOC LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT DIR |
| SR. MARKETING ASSOCIATE | ASST LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT DIR |
| MARKETING ASSOCIATE | LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATE |
| FRD DIRECTOR | YLD |
| ASSOCIATE/ASSISTANT FRD DIR | ARD DIRECTOR |
| FRD ASSOCIATE | ASSOCIATE HRD DIRECTOR |
| CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR | ASSISTANT HRD DIRECTOR |
| ASSOCIATE CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR | HRD ASSOCIATE |
| ASSISTANT CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR | REFUGEE RESETTLEMENT DIR/COORD |
| MAJOR GIFTS DIRECTOR | REFUGEE RESETTLEMENT STAFF |
| DIVISION DIRECTOR | JEWISH EDUCATION DIR/COORD |
| ASSOCIASST DIVISION DIRECTOR | JEWISH EDUCATION ASSOCIATE |
| REGIONAL DIRECTOR | PROGRAM DIRECTOR |
| ASSOC/ASST REGIONAL DIRECTOR | PROGRAM ASSOCIATE |
| SR. CAMPAIGN ASSOCIATE | RESEARCH DIRECTOR |
| CAMPAIGN ASSOCIATE | DIRECTOR MIS |
| SR. MAJOR GIFTS OFFICER | MIS STAFF |
| MAJOR GIFTS ASSOCIATE | WEBMASTER |
| CFO |  |
| ASSOCIATE CFO |  |
| ASSISTANT CFO | OTHER PROFESSIONAL STAFF |
| CONER FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL |  |

## Men and Women in Various Jobs

For only a few job titles do men exceed women in number, as women constitute nearly $70 \%$ of the total federation professional work force. Among the male-dominated job titles are: executive vice president/executive director, associate executive director and financial resource development director.

Women constitute the majority in all other job titles, and in some titles women are especially numerous. The positions with especially high proportions of female incumbents consist of the following: office manager, planning associate, division director (a mid-level campaign position), women's division director, endowment associate, Jewish education associate, program director, and program associate. Women dominate in entry-level or associate level positions.

At the same time, we find a near even gender balance in several high ranking positions such as chief financial officer, endowment director and chief operating officer.

| Percent Female by Job Title, <br> For Eight Highest Level Jobs  <br> Job Title $\%$ <br> Female <br> EXECUTIVE VPIDIRECTOR 31 <br> Jobs  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| ASSOCIATE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/COO | 44 | 34 |
| ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR | 54 | 37 |
| CFO | 50 | 50 |
| FRD DIRECTOR | 33 | 15 |
| ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR | 51 | 35 |
| CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR | 67 | 45 |
| PLANNING DIRECTOR | 65 | 31 |

## Gender Distribution for the Highest-Ranking Jobs, by City Size

Both job title and city size need to be considered simultaneously in order to understand the nature of gender distribution in the federation system. Accordingly, we examine the gender distributions focusing specifically upon the higher-ranking jobs in the federation system, disaggregated by city size.

These higher-ranking jobs may be divided into eight categories:

1) Executive vice president or comparable titles for the federation CEO.
2) Associate executive vice president, COO or similar titles.
3) Assistant executive vice president.
4) Chief financial officer
5) FRD director
6) Endowment director
7) Campaign director
8) Planning director

## Percent of Job Incumbents Who are Female <br> (by Type of Job and City Size)

| Job Title | CITY SIZE |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Large |  | Largel Intermediate |  | Intermediate |  | Small |  | Total |  |
|  | Female | Total Jobs | $\begin{gathered} \text { \% } \\ \text { Female } \end{gathered}$ | Total Jobs | \% Female | Total Jobs | $\begin{gathered} \% \\ \text { Female } \end{gathered}$ | Total Jobs | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \% \\ \text { Female } \end{array}$ | Total Jobs |
| Execs | 0\% | 19* | 17\% | 18** | 20\% | 54 | 54\% | 61 | 31\% | 152 |
| Associate Execs, COOs | 41\% | 17 | 14\% | 7 | 70\% | 10 | n/a | n/a | 44\% | 34 |
| Asst Execs | 31\% | 16 | 73\% | 11 | 83\% | 6 | 50\% | 4 | 54\% | 37 |
| CFOs | 35\% | 17 | 50\% | 10 | 59\% | 22 | 100\% | 1 | 50\% | 50 |
| FRD Director | 50\% | 2 | 20\% | 5 | 29\% | 7 | 100\% | 1 | 33\% | 15 |
| Endowment Director | 40\% | 10 | 33\% | 9 | 67\% | 15 | 100\% | 1 | 51\% | 35 |
| Campaign Director | 53\% | 15 | 80\% | 10 | 67\% | 18 | 100\% | 2 | 67\% | 45 |
| Planning Directors | 59\% | 17 | 73\% | 11 | 67\% | 3 | n/a | n/a | 65\% | 31 |
| Other Professionals | 73\% | 872 | 77\% | 218 | 82\% | 222 | 82\% | 57 | 76\% | 1369 |
| Total | 69\% | 1017 | 69\% | 303 | 71\% | 342 | 76\% | 87 | 70\% | 1768 |

[^0]Women constitute approximately 70\% of the entire professional work force in Jewish federations. However, their presence is far from evenly distributed by job and Jewish community size.

Thus, among the executives, the most senior position in the system, the proportion female increases sharply with decreases in city size. Specifically, with respect to the proportion female among chief executives, their number moves from 0\% in the 20 Large cities included in the sample, to $17 \%$ in the Large Intermediate cities, to $20 \%$ in communities of Intermediate size, to $54 \%$ in the smallest communities.

Percentage Female Chief Executives


At the same time, the gender distributions point to some intriguing patterns. Women constitute about half of the high-ranking professionals other than the executives, and about three-quarters of the other professionals. (For these purposes, high-ranking professionals here refers to such positions as associate executive, senior fund-raisers, planning directors, CFOs, etc.).

It is striking that there are a relatively large number of women serving in what are in effect the "number 2" positions in the largest communities. In such communities, women are $41 \%$ of associate executives, and $31 \%$ of assistant executives. This pattern is all the more noteworthy in light of women's total absence among the most senior positions in such federations.

We can only speculate as to the reasons for this discrepancy, but, perhaps the absence of women from the lead positions in the large communities has made them more competitive for the sub-executive posts, either because of their availability in the requisite talent pool, or because the executives (who generally make the appointments of their associates) seek gender diversity in their communities' top leadership ranks.

Summing up through the lens of city size, women are under-represented in a small number of job titles relative to their proportions among all federation professionals, and even relative to their proportions among middle- and lower-ranking professionals, as follows:

1) Executives of large, large-intermediate, and intermediate size communities.
2) Associate executives of large and large-intermediate size communities.

In other positions, women generally account for one half to three quarters of the professional staff, with little systematic variation by community size.

## Looking Forward

With these analyses in place, we can then analyze data collected in future years to learn of changes in all the issues alluded to above and more. Thus, we will be able to establish procedures that can understand, and portray year-to-year changes in gender variations in status and promotion in the federation system.

## ADDENDUM

| Percent Female by Job Title, Throughout the Federation System |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Job Title | $\%$ Female | Total Jobs |
| DIRECTOR MIS | 22 | 23 |
| EXECUTIVE VPIDIRECTOR | 25 | 89 |
| FRD DIRECTOR | 33 | 15 |
| ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR MIS | 33 | 15 |
| WEBMASTER | 33 | 6 |
| MIS STAFF | 38 | 52 |
| ASSOCIATE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR | 40 | 25 |
| SENIOR MAJOR GIFTS OFFICER | 50 | 6 |
| CFO | 50 | 50 |
| ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR | 51 | 35 |
| ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR | 54 | 37 |
| ASSOCIATE CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR | 55 | 11 |
| COO | 56 | 9 |
| SR. MARKETING ASSOCIATE | 57 | 14 |
| FRD ASSOCIATE | 57 | 7 |
| ASSOCIATE ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR | 58 | 19 |
| ASSOCIATE-ASSISTANT FRD DIR | 60 | 5 |
| PLANNING DIRECTOR | 65 | 31 |
| ASSISTANT CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR | 65 | 17 |
| ASSISTANT PLANNING DIRECTOR | 67 | 12 |
| CAMPAIGN DIRECTOR | 67 | 45 |
| SR ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATE | 67 | 33 |
| MARKETING DIRECTOR | 68 | 47 |
| OTHER PROFESSIONAL STAFF | 68 | 158 |
| ASSOCIATE PLANNING DIRECTOR | 70 | 10 |
| ASSOCIATE MARKETING DIRECTOR | 70 | 10 |
| OTHER FINANCIAL PROFESSIONAL | 70 | 104 |
| CONTROLLER | 70 | 43 |
| CRC DIRECTOR | 70 | 37 |
| MARKETING ASSOCIATE | 75 | 52 |
| MAJOR GIFTS DIRECTOR | 75 | 12 |
| JEWISH EDUCATION DIR-COORD | 76 | 25 |
| PERSONNEL DIRECTOR | 78 | 9 |


| Percent Female by Job Title, Throughout the Federation System |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Job Title | $\begin{gathered} \% \\ \text { Female } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Total } \\ & \text { Jobs } \end{aligned}$ |
| ASSISTANT ENDOWMENT DIRECTOR | 78 | 18 |
| CRC ASSOCIATE | 79 | 19 |
| PLANNING ASSOCIATE | 80 | 20 |
| REGIONAL DIRECTOR | 80 | 10 |
| DIVISION DIRECTOR | 81 | 31 |
| CAMPAIGN ASSOCIATE | 81 | 115 |
| PROGRAM DIRECTOR | 81 | 70 |
| HRD DIRECTOR | 82 | 11 |
| ASSISTANT MARKETING DIRECTOR | 83 | 12 |
| LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR | 85 | 13 |
| ASSOCIATE CFO | 86 | 7 |
| SR. CAMPAIGN ASSOCIATE | 88 | 51 |
| ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATE | 88 | 25 |
| PROGRAM ASSOCIATE | 88 | 51 |
| SR. PLANNING ASSOCIATE | 91 | 22 |
| JEWISH EDUCATION ASSOCIATE | 91 | 46 |
| WOMENS DIVISION ASSOCIATE | 94 | 18 |
| OFFICE MANAGER | 96 | 24 |
| WOMENS DIVISION DIRECTOR | 98 | 42 |
| SPECIAL ASSISTANT TO PRESIDENT | 100 | 6 |
| ASSISTANT PERSONNEL DIR | 100 | 4 |
| ASSOC-ASST REGIONAL DIRECTOR | 100 | 5 |
| ASSISTANT CFO | 100 | 5 |
| ASSISTANT WOMENS DIVISION DIR | 100 | 7 |
| ASSOCIATE CRC DIRECTOR | 100 | 4 |
| ASSISTANT CRC DIRECTOR | 100 | 4 |
| YLD | 100 | 9 |
| ASSISTANT HRD DIRECTOR | 100 | 4 |
| HRD ASSOCIATE | 100 | 12 |
| OTHER | 95 | 19 |
| Total | 70 | 1749 |


[^0]:    *There are 20 Large City federations: one community has an acting Director not included in analysis.
    **There are 19 Large/Intermediate City federations: one community has an acting Director not included in analysis.

