

### **A FLAME STILL BURNS:**

### The Dimensions and Determinants of Jewish Identity Among Young Adult Children of the Intermarried

### **Findings and Policy Implications**

**June 2005** 

### Pearl Beck, Ph.D. Principal Investigator

With the Support of the The Crown Family Foundation and the Toleo Foundation



Dr. Kerry M. Olitzky *Executive Director* 

Terrence A. Elkes

President

Eugene Grant *Chairman* 

#### Acknowledgements

This research could not have been conducted without the support provided by The Crown Family Foundation of Chicago and the Greensboro-based Toleo Foundation. Thanks to these foundations' generosity and foresight, there is now an empirically based body of knowledge to inform policies and programs for engaging the children of the intermarried.

I would like to express my gratitude to the following members of the study's Research Advisory Committee for their involvement with this project: Phyllis Adler, Debbie Antonoff, Rabbi Sam Cohon, Shellie Dickstein, Dr. Debbie Findling, Karen Gerard, Rabbi Jack Gabriel, Rabbi Sam Gordon, Stuart Himmelfarb, Dr. Bethamie Horowitz, Dr. Bruce Phillips, Dr. Linda Sax, Rabbi Harold Shulweis, Dr. Gary Tobin, Joan Wolchansky, and Rabbi Daniel Zemel.

A special thanks to Dr. Michael Rappeport, Stuart Himmelfarb, and Dr. Linda Sax who took the time to carefully review and comment upon the research instruments. My friend and colleague, Dr. Bethamie Horowitz, whose innovative research on Jewish identity served as the theoretical groundwork for this project, provided much appreciated feedback during the project's inceptive stage.

I am especially grateful to my outstanding team of interviewers – Dr. Sherry Israel, Dr. Jacqueline Mintz, and Mr. Alexander Shapiro – who brought their strong personal and professional skills to the interviewing job. The interview write-ups reflect their extensive understanding and insight into the lives of the people they interviewed.

I would especially like to acknowledge the multiple contributions of Dr. Sherry Israel. Sherry served as an interviewer and also as a valued "sounding board," particularly during the instrument development and the report writing stages of this project.

A special thanks to Dr. Ron Miller, who drew upon his considerable knowledge of the 2000-2001 NJPS database, to conduct an analysis of its "twenty-something" cohort. This analysis enabled us to compare our sample of people who grew up with one Jewish parent with their NJPS counterparts.

Ivana Bradanovic, JOI's Office Manager, played an indispensable role in the implementation of this project. She capably handled a large volume of phone inquiries, screened potential interviewees, and successfully juggled the scheduling of interview appointments in three different cities. Special thanks also to Beverly Schneider for providing editorial assistance and advice.

I would also like to thank the people and organizations who generously provided office space for our interviews; Lloyd Simon of Cambridge-Focus in Boston, Emily Freed of Joshua Ventures and Dr. Debbie Findling of The Goldman Foundation in San Francisco, and Emily Soloff of The American Jewish Committee in Chicago.

And last, but certainly not least, I would like to express my appreciation to the ninety individuals who participated in this research and who shared their life stories with us. We hope they benefited from the telling as much as we did from hearing their narratives. Finally, we would like to acknowledge the many other people who volunteered for the study but whom we could not interview for lack of resources. We hope they will have other opportunities to tell their stories and to reflect upon their Jewish roots.

### Table of Contents

		Page
l.	Introduction and Methodology	4
II.	Findings	7
	A. Background Demographics and Types of Religious     Upbringing      B. Current Jewish Identity: The Cognitive, Affective and Behaviora	
	Dimensions  C. The Social Context  D. Expectations Regarding Future Jewish Involvement and Connections  E. Experiences and Factors which Affected Jewish Identity	21 24
III.	Major Themes and Conclusions	41
IV. Recommendations44		
Re	eferences	
Ap	ppendices ppendix A: Comparisons of Key Jewish Connection Variables: JOI 2009 Data and NJPS 2000-2001 Data ppendix B: Interview and Survey Instruments	5 Study

## The Dimensions and Determinants of Jewish Identity among Young Adult Children of the Intermarried; Findings and Policy Implications

Pearl Beck, Ph.D. June 2005

#### I. Introduction & Methodology

The 1990 National Jewish Population Survey (NJPS) famously documented the upward bump in intermarriages that occurred during the 1980s. Twenty years later, the Jewish world is, in fact, grappling with a bumper-crop of young adults produced by these intermarriages. According to the 2000-2001 NJPS, approximately 366,000 people between the ages of 18-29 grew up with one Jewish and one non-Jewish parent. <sup>a</sup>

As this population increases, Jewish communal attention has begun to shift from identifying the causes of intermarriage and designing programs to stem its occurrence to understanding and addressing its consequences. In this vein, Egon Mayer (1994) cautioned: "those who ignore the potential for Jewish continuity amongst the descendants of the intermarried, given the magnitude of their numbers, are also condemning hope in the American Jewish future." In fact, during the past decade, the children of the intermarried have begun to receive increased attention from both policy makers and researchers. The 2000-2001 NJPS report identified considerably lower rates of "raising Jewish children" among intermarried compared to in-married households. Throwing down the gauntlet, the discussion concludes: "How the children of intermarriages will identify themselves when they grow up is unknown...." Thus, the mandate for follow-up research such as our own.

The theoretical context for our research is the widely shared and empirically supported recognition that modern Jewish identity has become voluntary, internal and personal, rather than religious and communal. Informed by Gans' (1979) theory of "symbolic ethnicity," many modern Jewish sociologists have posited a looser connection between the ethnic identity of American Jews and the fundamental values and rituals traditionally connected with Jewish life. For example, Israel (1995) suggests, "The cultural practices associated with this new kind of ethnicity are selective, intermittent, and largely symbolic. They make little claim on the person's basic American lifestyle." The voluntary and internalized form of Jewish identity has also been referred to as the "Jew within" (Cohen and Eisen, 2000), or the "subjectively engaged" (Horowitz, 2000).

The movement away from more easily measurable behaviors and activities and toward more private, internalized forms of Jewish identity has compelled Jewish social researchers, including the designers of large-scale studies such as the NJPS, to develop more sensitive tools to measure identity among the overall Jewish population.

<sup>a</sup> According to the NJPS report "Jewish College Students" which included people ages 18-29, which is somewhat broader than our target population (age 22-30).

1270 Broadway, Suite 609 New York, NY 10001 Tel: 212.760.1440 Fax: 212.760.1569 www.JOl.org

And in fact, the 2000-01 survey included subjective questions such as "How important is being Jewish in your current life?" as well as questions about the "Jewishness" of a person's social network.

However, the information obtained from these instruments was still found wanting by lay and professional leaders involved in developing policies and programs to engage the children of the intermarried. They believed that a more nuanced methodology than that provided by a large-scale phone survey was required to provide useful information about this population. Our study reflects the attempt to create a methodology that would successfully accomplish this goal.

Specifically, our research combined qualitative and quantitative methodologies to conduct an in-depth exploration into the current Jewish identity and into the identity-shaping experiences of people in their 20s who grew up with one Jewish parent. By going beyond the data elements contained in the 2000-01 NJPS, our study casts a wide net to examine the ties that connect this population to their Jewish roots. It builds upon previous research on the dynamics of intermarriage (Barack-Fishman, 2004), on the children of intermarriage (Phillips, 2001) and on the multi-dimensionality of a Jewish identity (Cohen, 2002; Horowitz, 2001). In researching the Jewish identity of a population which did not grow up with two Jewish parents, we assumed, as did Horowitz (2000) that "Jewish identity and Jewish practice no longer coincide and that people can view themselves as Jewish without doing anything traditionally considered Jewish" and that Jewishness consists of "a set of beliefs, images, feelings and practices that a person considers to be Jewish."

The decision to focus exclusively on a post-college cohort in their 20s was motivated by the recognition that this period in life is developmentally critical yet largely understudied. Most people in this population have completed college but are still in the early stages of settling down to a career and to a committed relationship. We thought that studying people in their 20s would provide an interesting opportunity to look both backwards and forwards; this population can reflect on the impact of previous life events (e.g., childhood, adolescence and college) and also discuss their thoughts and feelings about what they are currently experiencing as well as their plans for the future. Recently, other researchers have also begun to aim their lens on this age group (Greenberg, 2005).

We believe that our study presents a textured portrait—particularly in the qualitative descriptions—that reveals the complex, and multifaceted attitudes and behaviors of our respondents. This research is driven throughout by a pragmatic agenda: to develop policy initiatives and strategies for engaging this population of young adults in Jewish life.

Our study attempted to answer the following questions:

- To what extent do the offspring of intermarried couples identify as "Jewish"?
- What feelings, attitudes and/or activities connect this population to their Jewish roots?
- What factors and developmental experiences are related to some of the offspring having a Jewish identity while others do not?
- What was it like growing up in a home with parents who came from two different religious traditions?
- What can be done to strengthen and promote attachment to Jewish life among the children of the intermarried?

#### Methodology

We conducted 90 face-to-face interviews with people age 22-30 who grew up with one Jewish and one non-Jewish parent. Thirty interviews were conducted in each of three cities: Boston, Chicago, and San Francisco. Our respondents, who were paid \$75 for their time, were recruited via postings on Craigslist, a website that is widely used by people in this demographic. At the conclusion of the (approximately 90 minute) interview, respondents were also asked to complete a brief survey about their Jewish backgrounds and current Jewish connections. (See Appendix A.) Quantitative findings were obtained by coding the open-ended interview questions and also by coding the closed-ended questions contained in the survey administered at the termination of the interview.

We have also undertaken a comparison between several variables that were included both in our study and in the 2000-01 NJPS. The aim of this analysis was to determine the comparability of our interview sample of 90 individuals—who were not randomly selected—to the larger population of people in their twenties with similar Jewish family backgrounds. The analysis revealed that our sample was quite similar to a comparable sample of NJPS respondents on several key variables. (See Appendix B.)

#### **Organization of Report**

The findings comprise five sections:

- **A**. A description of the interviewees in terms of their background characteristics and the types of religious upbringing they received.
- B. Respondents' current Jewish identity, in terms of three major dimensions:
  - How they think about being Jewish (the cognitive dimension) which will include a discussion of the three major aspects of Jewish identity—religious, ethnic, and cultural;
  - How they feel about being Jewish (the affective dimension); and
  - What they do, if anything, to express their Jewishness (the behavioral dimension).
- **C.** The social context of Jewish identity, including the nature and extent of contact with Jewish people and Jewish institutions.
- **D.** Respondents' expectations about their connections to Jewish culture, religion and/or ethnicity in future years.
- **E.** Experiences and factors which might have affected respondents' Jewish identity, including:
  - Family-based experiences;
  - Jewish community-based experiences; and
  - Personal experiences.

### A. Background Demographics & Types of Religious Upbringing

#### **Background Demographics**

Of the 90 people interviewed, 39% were male (N=35) and 61% were female (N=55). (That the methodology consisted of an intensive one-on-one interview might have deterred men from participating, thus the over-representation of females.) Fifty percent of the respondents were between the ages 22-25 and another 50% were between the ages 26-30. Respondents were almost evenly split between those with Jewish fathers (54%) and those with Jewish mothers (46%). At the time of the interview, 60% of the respondents reported that their parents were still married to each other, while 33% reported that they were divorced. (Another 6% said that one of their parents was deceased.) Only three of our respondents were married, while approximately 50% reported being involved in a committed relationship.

#### **Types of Religious Upbringing**

In his research, Phillips (1993) identified four different ways of raising children within intermarriages: Christian Only, No Religion, Jewish Only, and Jewish & Christian ("half and half"). In our sample, 32% of the respondents reported that they were raised "half and half," while another 30% reported that they were raised without any religion; 26% said that they were raised "Jewish" and 12% reported that they were raised in "another religion" (e.g., mostly Christian).

When type of religious upbringing was compared with current religious identification, we found substantial continuity; nearly 90% of those who were brought up Jewish continue to identify themselves as "Jewish" while none of those who were raised in another religion currently regard themselves as Jewish. Those who grew up "half and half" manifested the greatest amount of change; approximately one-quarter of those who grew up in this way currently consider themselves Jewish. In contrast, we found negligible current Jewish identity among those who grew up with no religion.

Feelings about the importance of "being Jewish" also varied considerably by type of upbringing; nearly 90% of those who were raised either Jewish or "half and half" indicated that being Jewish was "somewhat" or "very" important to them and 43% of those raised with no religion and for only 33% raised in another religion. (Overall, nearly 70% of those interviewed said that being Jewish was either "somewhat" or "very" important to them.)

Despite the strong relationships between type of upbringing and current identity, there are also some interesting inconsistencies. For example, while those who were raised Jewish are overwhelmingly (90%+) more likely to observe Hanukkah. This holiday is also currently observed by three-quarters of those raised "half and half", 40% of those raised without a religion and even one in five of those raised in another religion. In general, the further one moves away from ritual observance and Jewish identity and the more one focuses on Jewish cultural events, the greater the similarity among the four groups. For example, regardless of type of religious upbringing, over 50% of the respondents attend Jewish cultural events.

Respondents whose non-Jewish parent was secular (e.g. "did not identify with any religion")<sup>a</sup> had considerably higher levels of Jewish identity than those who were raised by a parent who identified with another religion. For example, 62% of those with a secular non-Jewish parent currently identify as Jewish, compared with only 24% of those who grew up with a parent who identified with another religion. Similarly, respondents who grew up with a non-Jewish parent who identified with another religion were themselves three times as likely (22% vs. 7%) to currently identify with another religion. (These findings are very similar to those of Phillips (2005) who found that Jews

1270 Broadway, Suite 609 New York, NY 10001 Tel: 212.760.1440 Fax: 212.760.1569 www.JOl.org

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> This is higher than previous estimates of secular identification among the American population—which is 14%, according to Kosmin (2001).

by religion married to secular non-Jews engage in more Jewish rituals such as lighting Shabbat candles than do Jews married to partners who identify with another religion.)

# B. Current Jewish Identity; the Cognitive, Affective, and Behavioral Dimensions

# 1. <u>Cognitive Dimension: How People Think about the Different Aspects of their Jewish Identity</u>

Through the interviews and closed-ended survey questions, we explored the three major dimensions of current Jewish identity: the religious, the ethnic (which includes a sense of Jewish peoplehood), and the cultural.

#### a. Few Identify with the Religious Dimension of Jewish Identity

A minority of respondents report identifying with Judaism primarily through the religious dimension of Judaism. This information was derived by using several different strategies. When asked what religion they identified with, only 30% responded that they were exclusively "Jewish." In addition, when we asked whether or not they considered themselves "religious," less than one-quarter described themselves in this way. However, 70% identified themselves as "spiritual." Despite this low level of religious identification, nearly one-half celebrate Jewish holidays; 64% celebrate Hanukkah, 45% attend a Passover Seder and 21% reported fasting on Yom Kippur. It is possible that some respondents engage in these behaviors but do not experience them as religious activities. For example, Darcy said:

I got the best of both worlds—the celebrations and the practices, not the religion. Neither of my parents nor any one else in the family encouraged me to identify with one religion. The only thing that might be negative is that I now don't have a religious belief or identity.

Ben has a Jewish father and being Jewish is "somewhat important" to him. He stated:

I have never felt that I wanted to be less Jewish. Other Jews are kindred spirits. I'm glad I'm Jewish—it feels familiar and comfortable. However, I don't see myself as a religious Jew. In fact, nothing about religion is going to work with my personality.

Similarly, Jason thinks of himself as neither religious nor spiritual. Although he reported that being Jewish is "somewhat important" to him, he recorded "none" for religion.

A few respondents reported that they are actively struggling with the religious aspect of their Jewish identity. Rebecca from San Francisco, for whom being Jewish is "very important", identifies as a Reform Jew. She said that she is still figuring out what being

religious means to her; but for now she goes to services at least once a month and on the high holidays and "does all the holidays in the American Reform way."

A few described negative experiences when they visited a synagogue that might have deterred them from returning. For example, Diane said:

I went to High Holiday services in a synagogue that tries to draw in uninvolved Jews by using very creative services. If they were really interested in getting me attached, I would have expected someone from the Youth Board to have asked for my phone number, and told me 'we'll let you know when there is something you might be interested in.'

#### b. Weak Feelings of Connection to Ethnic Dimension/Jewish People

When asked to rate the personal importance of several attitudes related to Jewish identity, only 26% of the respondents reported that "the existence of the State of Israel is personally very important," the lowest rating among several measures of Jewish connections. These findings are consistent with the rate of Israel travel among those interviewed (18%).

The finding of weak support for Israel is consistent with other research on the overall American Jewish population. For example, Cohen (2002) concluded:

...for the most part, Israel has not been recently central to who American Jews are as Jews—and so the need to visit it, or learn about it, or wrestle with its importance to the Jewish people is far from pressing. The growing priority for American Jews is individual Jewish meaning, and the question is whether Israel enhances or detracts from that meaning. All too often, Israel has been judged and found wanting.

Only slightly higher (31%) was our respondents' support for the statement that "protecting Jews in foreign lands from persecution is personally very important." Fewer than 20% of those interviewed expressed a "sense of connection" with Jews around the world or in Israel.

Sam, whose father is Jewish and who said that being Jewish is "somewhat important" for him, admitted:

I feel some pride in my Jewish outsider status which plays a big role in my sense of Jewishness.... However, these positive associations stop at the border...and I tend to feel a pretty big disconnect with non-American Jews.

#### c. Jewish Identity Primarily Linked to Cultural Components

Despite their professed alienation from the religious and ethnic aspects of Jewish identity, many respondents felt comfortably connected to specific aspects of being Jewish. Indeed, some of our respondents were able to articulate aspects of Jewish general culture for which they had an affinity or with which they identified. The following quotes exemplify our population's ambiguous but comfortable relationship to something they consider the culture of being Jewish.

#### Laura said:

I like the cultural aspect of Judaism, but don't know much about the religious aspect. I know they go together but somehow I've learned to separate the two. I associate being Jewish with being liberal and open-minded and helping and assisting the poor.

Benjamin attempted to identify the anchors of his connection:

There's a deep cultural background, a kind of congruency, support, an emphasis on education and on community, on minorities sticking together. It's something I can't quite express, iconic things that give you a sense of belonging...like on the John Stewart Show, all those iconic catch phrases.

#### Similarly, Melissa said:

Being Jewish gives me a sense of connection and history and also a cultural ethnic identity. Being Jewish is like being female - something I am regardless of my involvement or lack of involvement with traditions.

Mara, whose family is from Russia, also recounts how her family had deep connections to specific aspects of Jewish culture, even relating to the Torah as a historical rather than religious document.

My family never attended religious services or celebrated religious Holidays, but we did read books by Jewish authors. I remember Sholom Aleichem and there were also other authors. I also think my family may have read the Torah in Russian for its history.

Despite the strength and poignancy of these assertions, the legitimacy of the Jewish cultural connection has often been regarded with a degree of skepticism and discomfort by the Jewish community. Nevertheless, it received support more than a decade ago from Egon Mayer, one of the pioneers of outreach to the intermarried, who suggested that the path to Jewish identity and continuity was to be found through a "fourth door—the general culture that is not specifically religious, that is not specifically directive and

instructional, and that is not necessarily geared to defending ourselves or raising more dollars (1992)."

#### **Identification through Jewish Food**

A strong attraction to and fascination with Jewish food was mentioned by many respondents. For example, Allison, who has a Jewish mother and resides in San Francisco, described how she calls her grandmother and asks for recipes because she finds "Jewish food comforting." Similarly, Jon from Boston said that being part Jewish gets expressed in his life in the following ways: "My mom's parents are the only people who send me Hanukkah cards and I really like knishes and other Jewish foods." In addition, many of the holiday celebrations described by those we interviewed centered around a shared meal with family and/or friends, rather than religious observance.

Melissa discussed the centrality of food to her Jewish identity:

Being Jewish gets expressed in my life on a day-to-day level through little Yiddish phrases and the foods I cook and eat. I like being Jewish for the food. Food such as chopped liver, rye bread, pickled herring, smoked fish, hamantashen and bagels remind me of 'family' and of being a kid.

#### **Identification through Jewish Humor**

Humor is another Jewish cultural element with which many people identify and from which many interviewees derived a sense of Jewish pride. Allison is a perfect example:

There are not so many Jewish people. When Jews make jokes, I feel proud because I'm part of this smaller group; it's a good bonding point.

Likewise, Sarah who attends school in Chicago and who grew up in New York stated:

I definitely have Jewish humor and identify that part of me which is funny as the Jewish part.

#### Attraction to Social Justice Values Inherent to Judaism

While political activism, voluntarism, and liberal attitudes are claimed by many interviewees, only a few traced the impetus for these activities to Jewish values. Jessica was an exception. She mentioned that receiving regular American Jewish World Service (AJWS) emails creates a moderate sense of connection with Jews around the world. When asked what Jewish things she did, Lauren replied: "I treat other people well, care about others, listen to what people say and learn new things."

Mara, who grew up in the FSU, mentioned that she sought out Jewish social action opportunities such as volunteering at a local Jewish nursing home or for Jewish Big Brother/Sisters:

I have always been interested in what's going on around me. I heard stories about Jewish kids in Russia which led to working with Big Sisters. If I could get involved in JCC or in Big Brothers/Sister volunteering I could find ways to connect with more Jews, because I am not going to join a congregation.

#### Identification with Jewish Values in Contrast to Other Political Beliefs

Some respondents indicated that their Jewish identity was not salient to them until they were confronted by people whose values differed sharply from their own.

#### Sarah reported that:

When I went abroad I was with kids from the south who had fundamentalist in-your-face views. I began to adhere more to Jewish principles than to agnostic principles. It was the first time I felt happy to be Jewish.

#### Sam said:

The older I get, the more I feel I want to cling to my Jewish side and the more I learn about it, the more appealing it seems. One factor is the current political climate in America: I think it's very important in these times to see an alternative to the Christian right as it's manifesting itself in this country. I associate being Jewish and views which are much more in line with my own.

Jason, a gay male, found himself at odds with the views of Christianity—"my father's religion"—and finds Judaism more open and accepting.

#### Identification with Values and Characteristics Perceived as Jewish

Many respondents who did not necessarily "do anything" Jewish, nevertheless identified characteristics they considered Jewish. Megan, for example, feels positive about being Jewish "because it's exciting and not everybody has it. Jewish things that I celebrate make me different from my friends and makes me stand out from the norm and I like that." Josh likes the "open feeling" in temple because it is "less forced and that there is a more open relationship with religion." He also likes that "there is more than one meaning or reason to any one specific experience in life."

Matthew derived a sense of pride from the history of Jewish tenacity and struggle:

I have nothing but positive feelings about my Jewish roots. The Jews have definitely been one of the strongest peoples in history. As far as what they've been through persecution-wise over time, they're up there at the top. It's one religion that's had to struggle and I have positive feelings about this because it shows that the people are passionate enough about their beliefs not to waiver.

#### d. Respondents' Relationship to their Jewish Identity

#### Jewish Identity Perceived as Only Religious Identity

Most of those interviewed were able to distinguish between the cultural and religious dimensions of Jewish identity. However, a distinct sub-group of respondents believed that they were not really Jewish because they did not subscribe to Jewish beliefs and did not engage in Jewish practices.

For example, Julia said:

People ask me if I'm Jewish and I say I'm Jewish because my mother is Jewish. However I don't think I look Jewish. I don't see Jewishness as nationality. I see it as a religion but to call yourself something you don't practice is not truthful.

Similarly, Stacey cites her cultural background as Ukranian and her religious background as Jewish:

The Ukrainian part is not so much any more. I have lived here almost all my life and consider myself American to the heart. The Jewish, that's a more difficult question. It is important, but I don't want people to look at me and say 'she's Jewish.' I identify with it, but I am not religious, so if religion doesn't come up, being Jewish doesn't come up.

Anne, who identifies as Catholic, recognizes the cultural aspect of being Jewish. She is struggling with various issues regarding her Jewish heritage and was bothered and torn by what she regards as the close bond between Jewish heritage and religion. "How can I not be Jewish just because I don't believe in the religion?" she asked. "If I'm Catholic, then I'm not Jewish; but at the same time, there are still all these parts of me that are Jewish."

#### Comfort Level with Dual "Half and Half" Identity

Overall, our respondents expressed comfort with their dual identity and described themselves as a "quilt" or "collage." Many volunteered that they identified themselves as "half-Jews" or as "half and half."

Jessica expressed clarity about her identity and its components. Her mother is Jewish and her father Italian. "I tell people I'm Italian and Jewish culturally, and my religion is Jewish. I consider myself bi-cultural...We started an on-line group at NYU for 'pizza bagels' as a joke, but now there are 16 of us. I think I'm lucky, because I had a Christmas tree in my house until age 8, but I'm not confused."

Anne, a lawyer from Chicago does not identify as Jewish but as half-Jewish. She found a book on the subject and has visited a website called halfjew.com, a site devoted to establishing an identity for half-Jews.

In a lot of ways, Jews are sort of the other. But then half-Jews are the "other other." And that's how I've always felt. Like sort of an outsider, but that I can blend with either group.

Ellen usually responds to questions regarding her religious, ethnic, or cultural background by saying:

I'm half-Jewish and half-Methodist. Then, if there are other Jewish people there they usually tell me I'm not half-Jewish because my mother's not Jewish which I find very narrow-minded. However, I don't usually get real defensive about it. Apart from being equally close to both sides of my family, the half-Jewish part is very important'—more than being half-Methodist...in the sense of its impact. For example, I haven't found myself in the position of having to defend Methodism in the way I have had to defend Judaism. In that sense being Jewish has had more of an impact on my life.

Michelle, on the other hand, presents the notion that her two halves cancel each other out. When asked about her religious, ethnic, or cultural background, she usually laughs and says "half-Jewish and half-Catholic, so nothing." In a similar vein, another respondent who had a Jewish father and a Catholic mother, described herself as a "mutt".

Phillip expressed pride in both sides of his family:

Sometimes I say I am Irish and Jewish. Yet they are not contradictory. I have a stronger connection with family, culture and religion on my Jewish side, but I am also proud of my father's heritage. He traces his ancestry back to the Mayflower and to Irish immigrant struggles.

Allegra also expressed comfort with her multi-layered religious identity. When asked about her religious identity, she replied:

I say that my father is a Jew and my mother is an atheist from a Protestant background....As far as religion is concerned, my father's Jewish religion has had more influence. Being Jewish in America separates you to some degree. In general, I see myself as a Unitarian Jew.

#### **Tolerance for Inconsistency**

There exists a substantial body of social-psychological theory and research (Festinger, 1954) which concluded that people are motivated to reconcile discrepant cognitions. These findings initially led us to believe that people who grew up in dual religion households would experience stress or discomfort until their religious identity issues were resolved in favor of one of the two religions. However, our interviews revealed that overall, respondents had a high degree of acceptance for their dual religion households and learned to juggle their multiple identities.

Rebecca hosted her Catholic boyfriend and his family for Christmas dinner last year and hosted them at her house this year for Hanukkah. While she has not found a synagogue she's "happy with" in Chicago, she upholds rituals, recites blessings in her home, prays, and notes "various times during the day when I'm conscious of making some kind of motion toward prayer." Sukkot is her favorite holiday and mentions that she tries to spend Rosh Hashanah and Yom Kippur in Massachusetts with her mother and extended family. She said that she never had a Jewish boyfriend and feels that it "doesn't matter, as long as they respect my background and I respect his."

Several interviewees mentioned that they had begun to do Jewish activities with their non-Jewish partner. For some of these people, this Jewish engagement represented a change from the past, possibly motivated by the increased salience of their Jewish identity.

Jason and his boyfriend—the non-religious son of a Lutheran pastor—don't do anything Jewish together yet, but Jason said he hopes to in the future.

Allegra is another example of a respondent who encompasses both regardless of the inconsistency. She frequently attends a Unitarian Church, although she is not a member, and also goes to the Jewish Film Festival. She reads books on Jewish topics, attends a Seder, lights the Hanukkah menorah she used when she was growing up. This year, she celebrated Hanukkah alone "just me and my non-Jewish boyfriend." She "tries to do all the holidays," despite the fact that her family did not go to Rosh Hashanah services when she was growing up.

## 2. <u>Affect Dimension; Most Interviewees had Positive Feelings about Being</u> Jewish/Their Jewish Roots

Nearly 70% of those interviewed for this research reported that "being Jewish" is either "somewhat" or "very important" to them, an almost identical proportion to that found in the NJPS for a comparable sample. These positive feelings could be rooted simply in visceral feelings, exist without substantial Jewish content and thrive despite identification with other religions.

Julia, representative of respondents who enjoy the warmth, fun and energy they associated with being Jewish, said: "I have overall good feelings. It reminds me of my mother's side of the family—the culture and the higher drama and the emotion. All accomplishments are recognized and celebrated." Similarly, Daphne remarked, "Being Jewish feels like family and gives me a warm feeling. I like what it embodies. The positive always outweighs the negative."

### Many Expressed Positive Identity, Yet Acknowledged That They Lacked Jewish Content

When interviewed many respondents poignantly described their limited familiarity with "things Jewish" including Jewish history, Jewish culture, and Jewish rituals.

Don, a 24-year-old man, is a poignant example of someone who began his own education by reading *Exodus* by Leon Uris:

I feel so unprepared to pass on anything Jewish. I feel that I'm going to get a 'C' on the test. I'm worried that I would be perceived as a 'phony.' Since my father and I share an interest in history and especially military history, we have read both read *Raid on Entebbe, My Story* by Moshe Dayan and Chaim Weitzman's autobiography.

#### Feelings about Jewishness among Respondents Who Do Not Identify as Jewish

Jay, a perfect example of those who have a positive attitude towards Judaism while identifying as Christian, describes himself as "firmly Catholic in practice and belief." He described Judaism as "a beautiful religion," and "not one that embraces hatred, like some perverted forms of other religions." He is very proud of his Jewish roots, in a Catholic way. "Jews are Christ's chosen people," he said, "so I feel proud to be affiliated with that."

#### A Few Respondents Had Negative Associations

Marli lives in San Francisco and is politically active and involved in many social justice activities. She is representative of others who carry negative feelings about the Jewish religion and Israeli politics.

Politically, I don't agree with the current politics of the Israeli government and I often feel that this gets identified with being Jewish.

She and others were also uncomfortable with the idea that they were "inescapably" Jewish because one of their parents was Jewish. For example, Marli also said:

I don't identify with the concept of being a chosen people and don't define myself as Jewish particularly because my mother is Jewish. It feels like a racist definition of identity—where your genes come from.

## 3. Behavioral Dimension; Hanukkah Observance and Cultural Activities Predominate

As noted earlier, a surprisingly significant percentage of respondents who come from homes in which Judaism had been eliminated as a religion, celebrated Hanukah.

#### **Celebrating Jewish Holidays**

With the exception of Hanukkah, it appears that the majority of this population does not celebrate Jewish holidays, which is consistent with the lack of centrality of religion to the respondents' Jewish identity. Forty-five percent of our respondents reported attending a Passover Seder and 21% reported fasting all day on Yom Kippur. Hanukkah is the most widely observed holiday; 64% reported lighting Hanukkah candles compared to 48% of their NJPS counterparts. In contrast, according to the NJPS, among their peers with two Jewish parents, 78% attend a Seder and 84% celebrate Hanukkah. (See Appendix B)

Francisco feels "definitely positive" about his Jewish roots. Although he did not have any formal Jewish education, go to Jewish camps, or have a bar mitzvah and feels only a weak connection with Jews around the world and in Israel. "I celebrate Hanukkah with my friend's dad who is passionate about telling the Hanukkah story," as experiences that have made him feel more Jewish."

Daniel said that his Jewishness is "not at all important in my current life." He celebrated Passover "a long time ago, during high school and celebrated Hanukkah for fun." He did it less fully this year and lit the menorah most nights, mostly with his family. He indicated on the survey that he has attended a Jewish cultural event in the

last year or two. "I also celebrated Christmas every year and celebrated Easter up to high school, as well."

#### **Attending Jewish Cultural Events**

Fifty-six percent of our respondents attend Jewish cultural events, such as Jewish movies, plays or museums. In fact, people who do not necessarily identify themselves as "Jewish" by religion also attend Jewish cultural events—although people who identify themselves as "Christian" are much less likely to do so. Unlike current levels of Jewish holiday observance, which appears to be highly related to childhood holiday observance, attending cultural activities does not appear to be related to prior engagement in Jewish activities, including Jewish cultural activities.

For example, Jennifer reported that she attends Jewish film festivals and "am always interested if I see a book on something Jewish."

#### **Engaging in Other Activities Experienced as "Jewish"**

There is almost no consensus among those interviewed regarding what it means to be Jewish, let alone what it means to "do Jewish activities." For older cohorts with two Jewish parents, it might be meaningful to ask—as does the NJPS—about synagogue or JCC membership. However, these patterns of attendance and membership typically don't pertain to a cohort in their mid-20s—whether they have one or two Jewish parents.

Given the relatively low level of holiday observance, we also asked our interviewees several questions to determine what they do, if anything, in their current lives that they considered Jewish. The majority responded to this question by mentioning cultural activities such as doing Jewish arts, attending Jewish movies, reading about Jewish topics, while others mentioned engaging in charitable activities such as clothing drives. For example, Katy said:

I worked extensively with Tikun Olam Volunteers, the Jewish Community Center and other various community organizations and learned the importance of 'giving back' from my parents.

Similarly, Sandra mentioned that she expresses her spirituality and religiosity through doing good deeds:

...I do so through my personal behavior such as by showing fairness in dealing with others, acting charitably, being kind, and by supporting equal rights. These behaviors are partly inherited from my father who was into volunteering, but also from my Jewish education. One thing I took away from Judaism is that you should live your beliefs.

Other respondents reported demonstrating their Jewishness by having a mezuzah or by wearing a hamsa (a talisman in the shape of a protective hand) which "spurs conversations about being Jewish."

Compiling a personal genealogy was one of the most interesting vehicles for Jewish expression reported by one of our respondents:

As long as I can remember, I have been curious about my roots. I think the fact that on both sides of my family no one really talked about 'the old country' made me more intrigued. Most of my relatives who immigrated were dead by the time I was born, and I always realized that if no one documented anything, the little information left would be lost with my grandmother, as much of it was. I felt a strong connection to her [my mother's mother] and especially wanted to learn more about her family. Now I am aware that my mother used to ask genealogical questions when she was a kid, too, so she must have had an effect on me. I'm sure you will be interested to hear that I also believe that I have long been searching for an identity. I didn't identify with the kids in my school and neighborhood on many levels and to this day feel out of place in American society.... Certainly this project has emphasized how connected I feel or want to feel to my Jewish roots, despite the fact that I am not religious at all. There are some amazing stories...that I will pass onto my kids someday to teach them about their Jewish roots as history.

#### Keeping Current with Jewish and/or Israel-Related News and Articles

Nearly 50% of the respondents indicated that they "frequently" stopped to read articles about Jewish topics in the newspapers or magazines. The tendency to stay current with Jewish and/or Israel related topics was found to be highly related to attending Jewish cultural events.

#### **Engaging in Jewish Journeys As a Byproduct of This Study**

We found little explicit evidence of past spiritual or Jewish journeys among those whom we interviewed. This was contrary to other researchers who identified spiritual seekers as a distinct sub-group among the people whom they surveyed (Horowitz, 2000; Wuthnow, 1998). However, during the debriefing at the conclusion of the interview, many of our respondents revealed that they were motivated to participate in the study by their interest to learn more about who they were through a better understanding of their Jewish roots.

For example, Larry, who was one of the most assimilated respondents, remarked:

I responded to the ad out of curiosity about the idea of identity: What is it that you are based on, what is the effect of what you came from? I have been researching my last name, thinking perhaps it could lead me to knowing my identity better.

Similarly, Julia was motivated to participate in the study because she wanted to establish that people with her background are "okay." She reported that when she was growing up, she didn't know any people with one Jewish and one non-Jewish parent and therefore wanted to make a contribution in this area and expressed curiosity about whether people with her background have chosen to have a religious identity.

Ellen said that she responded to the ad for the interview because "I wanted to explore my feelings about being Jewish. When I have a conversation like this, it helps me sort out my own feelings."

A friend mentioned the Craig's list ad to Emily. She said the cash was an issue, but "I was very interested because I hadn't heard of any research about being raised by a Jewish and non-Jewish parent. I have some issues I feel unresolved about that I'd like to think about and this interview has helped me to start to think about them."

#### **Celebrating Non-Jewish Holidays**

Christmas is observed almost universally by the children of intermarried couples. Our findings corroborated those of others researchers (Barack-Fishman, Phillips), that Christmas is typically celebrated almost exclusively as a family event rather than as a holiday with religious significance. Very few attend church as part of their Christmas or Easter celebrations.

#### C. The Social Context

#### Belonging to a Jewish Social Networks; Having a Jewish Partner or Close Friend

A comparison between our sample and their NJPS counterparts revealed that our sample had somewhat denser Jewish networks; while 85% of the NJPS subjects reported that "some or none" of their friends were Jewish, this was true for 70% of our sample. The denser social networks which characterized our sample are possibly attributable to the study's venues—three large urban centers containing sizable Jewish populations. And once they are exposed to social networks with higher concentrations of Jews, our population is likely to encounter Jewish people who are more Jewishly identified than they are. In fact, some of the slightly higher ratings we have found on several variables (e.g., Hanukkah and Passover observance) compared to the NJPS cohort with one Jewish parent, might be attributable to our sample's denser Jewish network.

Fewer than one-half of those interviewed were involved in committed relationships. Nevertheless, the few respondents with Jewish partners (18%) have been affected by their relationships.

Susan reported that she is now doing more Jewish activities as a result of her relationship with her Jewish boyfriend. For example, last year she made a Passover Seder in her apartment. She believes that she will become "more Jewish" over the next five years.

Jason commented that he had a girlfriend for a year who was "a quintessential North Shore Jewish girl," and she "kind of rubbed off on him." Due to her influence, he doesn't eat pork anymore.

Although Marla wasn't raised in a very Jewish setting, and rated being Jewish as only "somewhat" important to her, she attributes her increasing interest in Judaism to her committed relationship with a Jewish man.

## Contact with Jewish Institutions and Individuals; Extent of Feeling Accepted by Jewish Community

Respondents reacted quizzically to the question regarding whether or not they felt "accepted by the Jewish community." Because so few had any contact with Jewish institutions or organizations (e.g., synagogues, JCCs or Jewish schools), most of those interviewed interpreted this question to mean whether or not they felt accepted by individual Jews with whom they came into contact. While most said that they did not feel rejected by their fellow Jews, a few described experiences which caused them some discomfort.

For example, Ann an attorney in Chicago said:

I've always had a mixture of Jewish and non-Jewish friends, and have found my reception as the daughter of an intermarried couple to be mixed. When people find out I'm half-Jewish, the welcome I receive is more enthusiastic from some people than others. Still, I feel like if I moved somewhere and I went to do Jewish activities, they would accept me.

Most, like Melissa, did not feel rejected by their fellow Jews. However, she also commented that:

I feel accepted by all but the most observant types.... I feel comfortable and accepted among Jews in general and think I would be welcome in temple or synagogue, but I don't feel accepted by 'yarmulke-types'—although I don't think I would be accepted by 'hard-liners' from any religious group.

However Alex recounted a more difficult experience when he tried to find "a way in" to the Jewish community upon his return from a trip to Israel:

I felt particularly proud to be Jewish the first time I was in Israel—it was my first real immersion in Jewish culture. I returned from that trip wanting to participate in the Jewish community but unfortunately found the actual community insular and hard to become a part of. I went to a few Jewish community events when I got back from Israel but it seemed like the people had been playing basketball together for five years and I felt like an outsider.

#### **Geography and Jewish Identity**

Several Jewish identity measures were analyzed by the city where the respondents currently reside. (Because of this population's—and also the general American population's—high rate of residential mobility, their current city of residence was not necessarily the city where they grew up.) The findings indicate that people who currently live in San Francisco score lowest on several measures of Jewish identity. For example, 56% of San Francisco respondents claimed that "being Jewish" was either "somewhat or very important" as compared to 74% of those in Chicago and 70% in Boston. Because the San Francisco respondents were less likely to identify themselves as "Jewish" by religion, it is not surprising that they were also less likely to attend Passover Seders (San Francisco, 17%; Chicago and Boston, 57%). San Francisco residents were also much less likely to celebrate Hanukkah than their peers in the other cities (San Francisco, 43%; Chicago, 73% and Boston, 70%).

Nevertheless, when respondents were queried regarding their participation in Jewish cultural activities such as attending Jewish movies, museums, festivals etc., no differences emerged among the three cities (San Francisco, 53%; Boston and Chicago, both 57%). By including Boston in the study, we also (inadvertently) tapped into one of the country's largest concentrations of Catholics (Kosmin et al, 2001). This population's Catholic roots were particularly evident in response to questions regarding celebrating Christmas (Boston, 93%; San Francisco, 80%; Chicago, 63%) and Easter (Boston, 63%; Chicago, 30%; and San Francisco, 23%).

### D. Expectations Regarding Future Jewish Involvement & Connections

Given people's tendency to perpetuate family patterns and given prior research that found that the overwhelming majority of children who grew up in intermarried families themselves intermarry, it is not surprising that 86% of respondents who were in committed relationships were involved with non-Jewish partners.

#### Importance of Finding a Jewish/Similar Partner

Respondents' generally did not view having a Jewish partner as important. This is consistent with the finding that only a small minority of them (14%) are currently involved in a serious relationships with a Jewish partner. Attitudes about their partners' religion appear to vary person-to-person and over time for the same person.

#### Don noted:

It would be a bonus if the person were Jewish. I don't think I could be involved with someone who is strongly religious in a Christian way though I might be involved with someone who is strongly Jewish.

#### Jessica reported that:

None of my closest friends are Jewish and I am not attracted to Jewish boys. Both of my parents want me to be with someone Jewish, which is hypocritical because my mother intermarried. I've been dating boys who are not much into anything, so I could convert them. The last boy's family didn't like it that I was Jewish.... If I have children, I want to pass on my Jewish identity. I'm not worried about it; I'll join a synagogue and bring them to religious school.

Abby is currently single. She said it is "somewhat important" that she marry someone Jewish, this person could not be Orthodox. She feels she "couldn't handle the 'BS' of a devout Christian," and although she's "never actually dated a Jew," she loves "the culture and would love to be with somebody of that cultural background." She also thinks being with someone who was Jewish would "make it easier to explore that part of who I am."

Perhaps even more complicated are people like Anne, who will be married in the Catholic Church, wants to educate her kids Catholic and who admits that she wants to pass on to her future children a sense of their Jewish roots, but does not know how she'll go about doing so. "It would really bother me if my children didn't identify with being Jewish at all."

#### **Attitudes about Raising Jewish Children**

Consistent with our observation that this population has a considerable tolerance for inconsistency and contradiction, a significant proportion of participants (60%) indicated that having a Jewish partner is <u>not</u> important to them while a substantial number (76%) also expressed a desire to "transmit a Jewish ethnic identity to their children." Among those interested in transmitting a Jewish identity, many explicitly indicated that they were not interested in transmitting a religious identity.

If I decided to have children, I would be inclined to raise them much as I was raised and teach them as much as I know and not pressure them. I would show them all kinds of religions support any direction other than Jewish until they were old enough. There's a reason why people have coming of age ceremonies.

David doesn't know what he will do vis-à-vis passing his religious or ethnic identity on to prospective children. He believes that he needs to "look within myself first for greater understanding of the Jewish part, religion and values." Were he to pass on his religion and values, he would do it by "participating more in temple." He feels that he "missed out too much on schooling, intricacies of the religion to be able to pass it on."

Along these lines, some respondents do indeed exhibit interest in transmitting the content of Jewish religious life to t heir children.

I would want to raise my children with a higher level of religious education than I received—if only so I can get more Trivial Pursuit questions right—and make sure that my kids are aware of their Jewish heritage, the Holocaust, and the holidays.

#### **Expectations Regarding Constancy/Fluidity of Jewish Identity**

When asked whether they thought they would be "more Jewish," "less Jewish" or "pretty much the same" during the next 5-10 years, 74% stated that they expected their identity to remain stable and another 24% reported that they expected to be "more Jewish." There was a slight (and probably realistic) tendency among those who expressed preference for a Jewish partner to believe that they will be "more Jewish" within the next 5-10 years.

Gail thinks that she will feel more Jewish in the next five to ten years. She explains that the reason she pursued J-Date is because she wants to pass on a religious and/or ethnic identity to her children.

Joanna said that she would want to pass on a sense of morals and community to her children and would want them to feel spiritual. If her husband were Jewish and wanted to raised children as Jews, she would; if Catholic, only maybe. She would not give them any religious instruction, unless they wanted it.

During the next five to ten years, I do not foresee myself feeling any more or less Jewish but I think I'll be open-minded as I've tried to be my entire life and if something came along, some kind of information, or a person and invited me to services, I would be open-minded about that, too—as long as it was laid back.

Allegra indicated that she anticipates being pretty much the same in five to ten years in terms of her feelings about being Jewish. She also says, "right now, I'm on sort of a learning quest on the back burner. It's not the most important thing that I'm dealing with in terms of my identity. When I am in a relationship and am thinking about having a family, I will go on more of a learning quest."

#### Abby said:

I've always felt like I was floating. I knew I was Jewish, but we didn't go to temple, celebrate holidays or talk about Israel. In medical school, I imagine I'll encounter more Jews and this will make her feel more Jewish because I always feel more Jewish around Jewish people. Children would have a similar affect because I'll try my best to have them identify with Jewish culture by joining a temple, going to services, meeting other Jewish parents and also possibly sending them to Jewish summer camps.

Darcy, who works in business and writes sitcoms and short stories in her spare time, is interested in learning more about Judaism, and believes she will feel "more Jewish" in five to ten years. The motivation behind this, she said, is not altogether unselfish. She believes being Jewish will help her establish more business contacts in the field of entertainment and will make her a more successful person. She also believes "being Jewish in Hollywood is good," and that more of a Jewish persona might help her career in that direction, as well.

# E. Experiences and Factors which Affected Jewish Identity including Family-Based, Jewish Community-Based, and Personal Experiences

In this section, we focus on three levels of experiences which specifically helped to shape and strengthen Jewish identity among the respondents and which contributed to making them aware of their Jewish roots: those that are family based; those related to organized Jewish life; and finally, those experiences that mostly took place within the personal sphere.

#### **Family-Based Experiences**

#### **Current Religious Identity Similar to Religious Upbringing**

As noted before, we found substantial continuity between a person's current religious identity and the way they were raised by their parents. In terms of our quantitative results, nearly 70% of the interviewees are currently of the same religious persuasion—including "no religion" as they were raised. This persistence of family patterns is possibly attributable to the affection and respect which respondents generally had for their parents.

However, a strong exception to this overall trend occurred when a respondent grew up in a family environment characterized by substantial dysfunctionality. In those situations, the children often sought a completely different path from either parent, in an attempt to separate themselves from the family's inherent pathology.

#### Religiously Identified Parent Determines Children's Religious Upbringing

In families where a child was being raised in a specific religion, one parent had a strong preference for his/her religion and the other parent did not possess an equally strong religious identity.

Sarah ironically described this situation: "My parents had a compromise. My father was willing to 'hand me over' to my mother and my mother 'took the reins."

Sometimes, the impetus for raising a child within a specific religion derived from a family member other than the parent.

For example, Meredith said:

It was very important to my side to have us be Catholic and my mother just wanted to be sure her children would be raised to have a sense of morals and belief in God. Therefore, my parents agreed that it would be confusing to raise the children in two religions so we were raised Catholic. This is funny, because my father is not a very religious guy, he doesn't like church. He probably raised us Catholic just to please his parents.

#### **Supportive Non-Jewish Spouse**

Some of the people whom we interviewed were raised by a non-Jewish parent who actively supported and encouraged the raising of their child within the Jewish religion. These parents did not just compromise or "give-in" regarding their child's religious upbringing. Instead, they played the role of "the supportive non-Jewish spouse" (Simon, 2005). The child's Jewish identity appeared to be enhanced when the non-Jewish parent exhibited supportive and positive attitudes regarding Jewish life and Judaism.

Sarah described how her father embraced Judaism when he met her mother, although he never converted to being Jewish:

He attended temple and not only could say all the prayers, he also knew what they meant. The only time my father's religion was a problem was at my Bat Mitzvah when my dad wasn't allowed to hold the Torah. This hurt us both and was the only time my dad felt like an outsider.

#### Parents' Religious Differences Were Not Necessarily A Source of Tension

Given the documented higher divorce rates among intermarried couples, we had anticipated numerous accounts of tense and unharmonious family situations attributable to the religious differences between the parents. However, this was not reported among our sample. The presence of a supportive non-Jewish spouse undoubtedly also helped to reduce the potential tension levels in a household. Several respondents reflected and/or speculated upon the various compromises that undoubtedly took place between their parents.

Jon said that his "mom gave in on Christmas." He thinks of himself now as neither religious nor spiritual. "My mother is Jewish and my father is Protestant. He remembers that "we were a weird mix. We'd light the Hanukkah menorah and have a Christmas tree, do Passover Seders and have Easter." He remembers thinking it was strange: "Here we are sitting under the Christmas tree, but my mother is Jewish. I guess this means that my parents had agreed to compromise."

The compromises sometimes were quite literal. Shannon related how her parents had a complicated "1 for 1 deal"—if one week she attended church, the next week Shannon had to attend synagogue. In fact, she decided against having a bat mitzvah, because if she did she would also have needed to a communion ceremony.

#### Significance of Having a Jewish Mother

Only 45% of respondents with Jewish fathers as opposed to 77% of respondents with Jewish mothers indicated that their Jewish parent encouraged them to "identify with the

Jewish religion." The key role played by mothers in childrearing in general and in raising Jewish children in particular has been corroborated by other research. For example, Phillips (2005) found that "mixed-marriage fathers who were Jewish by religion were less likely to raise Jewish children than Jewish by religion mothers, regardless of the religion of the spouse." That mothers were more likely to be in charge of a child's education is evidenced by the following finding: a majority (63%) of children whose mothers encouraged them to identify Jewishly received some Jewish education while only a minority (35%) of children whose fathers encouraged them to identify Jewishly were educated accordingly. Similarly, while 64% of children with Jewish mothers had a bar/bat mitzvah, only 37% of children with Jewish fathers had bar/bat mitzvahs.

#### **Respondents Aware of Traditional Concept of Matrilineal Descent**

Despite their widespread and general and professed lack of knowledge regarding Jewish rituals and practices, our research participants were aware that traditional Judaism considers only the offspring of Jewish mothers to be fully Jewish. Our especially the case if mothers were strongly Jewishly identified and raised the children to be Jewish. (As was previously mentioned, this occurred more often with Jewish mothers than with Jewish fathers.) This perception was also often reinforced by Jewish people with whom they came into contact.

For example, Michael said:

I want to feel close to the Jewish community. I feel ashamed when I say I am Jewish, because my mother isn't Jewish. It feels a little fraudulent, because people have told me I'm not really Jewish because my mom's not Jewish.

Sonya reported: "I thought, since Judaism is matrilineal, it didn't matter much that my dad wasn't Jewish."

Sarah may be discerning when she said:

When people ask me if I am Jewish, I say 'my mom is Jewish.' If my dad were Jewish, I would only be one-half Jewish. In fact, if I had Jewish father, I would have felt that I would need to study and learn more.

Yet for some, having a Jewish mother merely served to underscore the discrepancy between their ascribed status as "Jewish" and their lack of Jewish identification. Matt said: "According to you, having a Jewish mother makes me Jewish, but it doesn't make me feel more Jewish."

Several respondents expressed resentment when Jewish people informed them that they weren't Jewish because their father, rather than their mother, was the Jewish parent.

#### For example, Katy said:

I found it frustrating when Jewish kids were dismissive of my Jewish side. More than once they made clear to me that I am not Jewish because my mother is not Jewish, that if I do both religions, I might as well not do anything Jewish. I felt I was pushed back from being more open to it.

#### Parents Believed in Providing Choices Regarding Religious Identification

Some parents maintained the household's equilibrium by not imposing any religion on their children. This often represented a deliberate and thought out strategy on part of the parents. While parents undoubtedly perceived this position as the ultimate "fair" option, because they did not impose an unwanted belief system on their children, we were often exposed to demurring viewpoints during the interviews.

For example, Jason expressed a decidedly negative sentiment regarding this type of upbringing:

No religion would be the main religion. That seemed to be the agreed upon thing. As a result, I had really no religion. I learned about heaven and hell at the lunch-table in school, and accepted it as fact for a long time. There are north and south and east and west and then up is heaven and down is hell. That's what they said. I'm resentful of not having religion. It's like they sent you into battle without a shield. You get a jumbled perspective, and you don't feel connected to a group of people.

#### Mark was more equivocating:

I liked growing up with parents who came from two different religions because I wasn't forced to do anything I didn't want to do. My parents agreed that the children should be free to form their own ideas. My mother went to Catholic school and didn't like it and wanted us to form our own impressions on religion and where we fit in. I don't know the flip side; maybe it would be good to be forced to believe something for a while.

#### Daphne:

My parents agreed not to provide their children with any religious upbringing—although they told us that it would be ok if we explored. My parents said that they 'worshipped the holy pancake,' meaning that they preferred eating on weekends to attending religious

services. Although they said they wanted their children to choose, in the end, we had no basis for this choice.

#### Ben indicated:

During my childhood, though my parents had the best of Intentions of raising me as neither and allowing me to choose my own course, I think in some ways I grew up not having an identity and not feeling a part of anything; that might have been an unintended consequence.

#### Similarly, Michelle said:

My parents' apparent resolve not to encourage me in a religious direction effectively separated me from both.

## Siblings Exposed to the Same Religious Upbringing Can Have Very Divergent Adult Religious Identities

Several respondents described how their siblings ended up identifying with different religions, despite a parent's efforts to encourage them to follow a specific religion or despite both parents' agreement not to foist any religion on their children.

For example Jessie, who currently identifies as Christian, attributes these differences in religious identity to underlying personality differences among the siblings.

My siblings and I had "the same situation" growing up, but had different experiences depending on their personalities. My older sister, who hated both Judaism and Christianity, wouldn't go to synagogue or church with either one of our parents... She is now a practicing Wiccan. My older brother's interest was always in Judaism, so he went to Hebrew school. It was his choice and I don't know why he made that choice. He had a bar mitzvah and it was very memorable, probably one of the best parties I've ever been to.

Some respondents theorized that their siblings had specific experiences which led to their developing stronger or weaker Jewish identities. For example, Jackie attributes her own strong Jewish identity to being the only Jewish person in her high school and to having been exposed to anti-Semitic insults. Subsequently, her parents sent her younger sister to a boarding school where there were many Jewish students. Jackie believes that as a result, her sister's Jewish identity did not become as heightened as her own.

#### Respondents' Grandparents Played an Important Role in Shaping Jewish Identity

The majority of our respondents indicated that they had significant contact with their grandparents when they were growing up—and nearly 85% of them established strong

relationships specifically with their Jewish grandparents. In the course of the interviews, many described the pivotal role played by grandparents in shaping their Jewish identities.

My grandfather waited until I was around eleven or twelve, when I was able to comprehend it a little more. And even as he was an influence, it was not by pushing or preaching. He enjoyed his spirituality, and he showed me how important it was to be Jewish, and how to maintain it.

Unfortunately, until recently, this important role has been overlooked by those studying religious development (Barack-Fishman, 2004), possibly because, as explained by one of the interviewees, a grandparent's influence is often not apparent until their grandchildren are older. A common thread running through many of the interviews about grandparents was that the Jewish grandparents were "a lot warmer, more grandparent-like to me," while the non-Jewish grandparents were "colder."

One of Sonya's few Jewish recollections is of her "grandfather crying at the part of her bat mitzvah where they carry the Torah around."

Melissa remembered sitting down and having her grandmother tell her stories of growing up Jewish in New York in the early 1900s, and her grandmother promising her that "someday you'll find yourself a nice Jewish boy."

While grandparents have the potential to exert a significant positive influence on their grandchildren's Jewish identity, removing them from the picture can have the inverse effect. For example, Joanna's Jewish grandparents refused to see her father after he intermarried. The result was that she was completely cut off from Jewish life and experiences. The family dynamic of grandparental rejection distanced her father completely from anything Jewish. When interviewed, she exhibited somewhat more positive feelings about Jewishness than Catholicism, but Joanna does not believe that her having Jewish roots gets expressed in her life in any way.

#### Celebration of Jewish and of Non-Jewish Holidays when Growing Up

Because of the universal popularity of Christmas, the children of intermarried couples reported a much higher incidence of celebrating only "non-Jewish" holidays (typically Christian) when growing up (25%) than of celebrating only Jewish holidays (10%). The largest proportion of our respondents celebrated a combination of the two (65%).

Eve gave a vivid example of how families tried to integrate the symbols of both holidays: "We always lit Hanukkah candles and also had a Christmas tree with a Star of David on top."

#### Keith said:

When I grew up, I celebrated Christian holidays with my father's family for what they're worth but not the meaning. We had a Christmas tree, for example, but didn't celebrate Christ. Easter was the same. I've been celebrating Easter for twenty-two years and I couldn't tell you a thing about it. These occasions are a nice way to get together with my family and have a nice meal. No songs of prayer and no deep meaning.

Hanukkah was celebrated by 76% of our respondents and 80% reported that they attended a Passover Seder when they were growing up. Approximately 90% celebrated Christmas and a similar percentage reported having a Christmas tree. Over 80% reported that they celebrated Easter. The majority of those interviewed agreed that holidays were not regarded by their families as religiously significant events. Instead, they were regarded as opportunities to get together and partake in a festive meal.

#### Jewish Identity Related to Connection to Holocaust - Familial or Cultural

When asked to rate the personal importance of several attitudes related to Jewish identity, the most highly rated item was "keeping people aware that the Holocaust took place"—endorsed as "very important" by 53% of the respondents. The centrality of Holocaust remembrance to American Jewish identity has also been documented by other research (Horowitz, 2000; Israel, 2001). When interviewees were asked whether, to their knowledge, any of their family members had perished in the Holocaust, approximately one-third responded affirmatively—which might account for their strong interest in this event. Furthermore, when we coded their grandparents' country of birth, at least one-quarter and possibly as many as one-third of our respondents had a (Jewish) grandparent who was born in one of the countries occupied by the Nazis during WWII. Moreover, in many interviews the Holocaust kept re-emerging as an essential theme related to our respondents' Jewish identity.

Phillip revealed that the Holocaust matters a lot to him, "and it affects all of us." He remembers a friend's survivor grandparents at their Seder, and his mother told him what it was about. He heard people talk about it in Hebrew school and there was a program about it in school in seventh grade. He remembers being angry at his friends who got excused from watching it.

When asked whether he had any pivotal Jewish experience Jessie replied:

This is going to sound cheesy, but watching 'Schindler's List' was a pivotal experience for me. I was inspired and then went to some services.

Meghan stated that "the European Holocaust hardened my resolve to have kids who identify as Jews because the world has been depleted of the enrichment that Jews bring."

Tara explained that "in cases where Jews are being persecuted or harmed because they are Jewish I feel more for them than a random person being persecuted because they're the same as me. My cousin escaped from a concentration camp and so the tie to those being persecuted hits home more than those just walking around."

#### **Exposure to Popular Jewish Cultural Experiences when Growing Up**

When questioned about their exposure to Jewish experiences, a very large proportion of respondents mentioned two specific experiences: being taken to see "Fiddler on the Roof" and/or "Schindler's List." In other words, for many of these young people, Jewish history, as filtered through a Hollywood or Broadway lens, was their sole "Jewish experience" when growing up.

Gail recounted how her Jewish father died when she was 7 years old. Her family was involved in Jewish cultural activities like seeing films, plays, and going to museum exhibits such as Art Spiegelman's *Maus* exhibit. Dana believes that attending these events was the original source of her interest in art.

Bob said that his mother read Jewish books, and took him and his brother to Jewish movies. "Mom tried to expose me and my brother to Jewish culture, and it was for herself, too."

#### **Recalling Childhood Jewish Experiences**

Since a substantial amount of Jewish experiences—especially religious experiences—are passed down through the generations, not engaging in some rituals from childhood resulted in some of the respondents feeling as though they were at a disadvantage. Yvonne said she sometimes feels "out of place when people talk about their experiences as kids." "I feel like I missed out on a lot," she said. "Things that your friends learned as kids," such as, "certain holidays, certain practices, and other aspects of the religion," she explained, "I'm just learning now."

#### **Jewish Community- Based Experiences**

An index was created of six different Jewish experiences which a person might have engaged in: having a bar/bat mitzvah, receiving Jewish education, attending a Jewish summer camp, belonging to a Jewish organization or youth group, attending Hillel in college or enrolling in a Jewish Studies course. Nearly one-third of those interviewed did not participate in any of these activities. However, 40% had participated in either one or two activities while smaller proportions had engaged in between three and six such activities. An analysis revealed that there was a strong relationship between the

proportion of Jewish activities a person had been involved in and the extent to which they felt that "being Jewish was important to them."

#### Receiving Jewish Education and Having a Bar/Bat Mitzvah

Nearly one-third of those interviewed indicated that they received some formal Jewish education and 18% reported that they attended a Jewish preschool.

#### Having a Bar/Bat Mitzvah

Among those interviewed, having had a bar/bat mitzvah is highly related to positive current Jewish identity. Less than one-quarter of the respondents had a bar/bat mitzvah when growing up. However, among those who had a bar/bat mitzvah, 90% currently consider themselves exclusively "Jewish" by religion, yet only 13% of those who did not have a bar/bat mitzvah so identify. Having had a bar/bat mitzvah was also related with current strong positive feelings about being Jewish; 40% of those who had a bar/bat mitzvah compared with a negligible proportion of those who did not have a bar/bat mitzvah said that being Jewish was "very" important" to them. Whether or not an individual had a bar/bat mitzvah was related to higher levels of Jewish identification on the part of their Jewish parent—especially their Jewish mother; 55% of those whose mother was strongly Jewishly identified had a bar/bat mitzvah compared with 33% of those whose father was strongly Jewishly identified.

Marissa, who claims that being Jewish is "very important", went to religious school from second through tenth grade, and then volunteered as a Hebrew tutor through high school. She poignantly described her bat mitzvah at great length.

When I was thirteen, more of my dad's family was alive, and they were all there, their first time in a synagogue. I was the first grandchild on both sides. Both grandmothers came on the bimah. The synagogue has certain blessings for the non-Jewish parent to say. I led the entire service, most of it in Hebrew. I read from the Torah, the part that is on the Liberty Bell.... I wanted to read the gender-sensitive version of the prayers, but the Rabbi, who is obsessive-compulsive (our services don't run on Jewish time), said 'we can't have papers flapping in the service' so he didn't let me. The only issue was that I didn't want to chant, so I just read the blessings. The party was low key, not like a wedding, the way some are.

Mara came to the U.S. from USSR when she was eight along with her mother who was as an ethnic Muslim. Mara said joining BBYO as a teenager had a very significant impact upon her subsequent Jewish identity:

My advisor in BBYO was the single individual who most influenced me to feel more Jewish. It was the first time I actually was a part of anything religious. Up until then Jewish was a nationality not a religious affiliation. When I joined BBYO, I started to do more religious things including having a bat Mitzvah when I was 16 at the South Wall in Jerusalem when I went to Israel with a group of Russians during the summer of my junior year in high school.

#### **Attending Jewish Summer Camp**

Only 16% of the respondents had attended a Jewish camp, which is comparable to the (13%) rate of Jewish summer camp attendance among the NJPS sample. Attending a Jewish summer camp was highly related to other Jewish experiences during childhood such as having a bar/bat mitzvah and receiving a Jewish education. It was also related to traveling to Israel; while nearly 40% of children who attended summer camp have traveled to Israel, this was true for only 15% of those who did not attend Jewish summer camp.

The respondents who attended Jewish summer camp spoke about its enduring impact on their lives. For example, Randy, a Chicagoan, said that summer camp was a pivotal experience for her because it is where she learned "that there are no right or wrong answers in Judaism." Another respondent, Matthew, from San Francisco, was raised in New York City, attended Jewish sleep-away camps. He said that these camps "played a big role in my life and helped shape my character and sense of responsibility."

#### Visiting Israel

Eighteen percent of those interviewed had visited Israel. This proportion is somewhat higher than among a comparable sample of NJPS survey respondents (13%). As previously mentioned, Israel travel was also highly related to being involved with other aspects of Jewish life when growing up, such as having a bar-mitzvah or receiving Jewish education.

Our study found that Israel had a very positive impact on those who traveled there. Three-quarters of those who traveled to Israel considered themselves "Jewish" by religion as compared to only one-quarter of those who have not traveled to Israel. Israel assumed greater significance for those who had visited; 43% of those who had been to Israel but only by 22% who had not been to Israel endorsed the statement: "the existence of the state of Israel is extremely important to me personally."

A specific finding regarding Israel travel has important possible implications for this population. People who traveled to Israel appeared to have more close friends who are

Jewish than those who did not travel to Israel, regardless of whether or not they had a bar/bar mitzvah.

#### Adam reported:

I loved seeing biblical places up close and was amazed by the undying spirit of the Israeli people. If Americans had so many terrorist attacks people would never leave their houses. I would absolutely like to return.

#### Alex said:

Should I decide to have children, I would want them to go to Israel when they're young and impressionable. When you send a kid to Israel when they're young there's a better chance they'll marry Jewish after seeing the importance of the religion there.

Abby reported that her "birthright' experience absolutely" had a large affect on her:

It connected me in a realistic rather than in an elusive way to my Jewish roots. Going to Israel was a realization of what it is to be Jewish. The history is intricate, beautiful, and sad, and I really am a genuine part of it. Before, I didn't feel much connection to Jews around the world. Now I do feel connected to Jews around the world now.

## Belonging to Jewish Clubs and/or Organizations when Growing Up

Approximately 19% of the respondents indicated that they had belonged to Jewish clubs or organizations when growing up. Further analysis revealed that over 80% of those who claimed to have affiliated with an organization also had bar/bat mitzvahs, which was the case for only approximately 10% who did not belong to organizations. Thus, we see that there is a substantial overlap between various types of Jewish affiliation.

#### Attending Hillel; Positive and Negative Encounters with Jews at College

Nearly 30% of the respondents reported having attended Hillel, an almost identical proportion to that reported by the NJPS. There is a vast difference between the identities of those who "step inside Hillel" and those who don't: 91% of those who visited Hillel compared to 58% of those who did not visit Hillel, indicated that "being Jewish" is either 'somewhat' or 'very important' to them.

In college, Jason wanted to continue learning more about Judaism, but felt uncomfortable going alone to a Hillel event. He called a friend he knew was Jewish and they went together. Once there, Jason said, "the Hillel people were really kind and friendly and welcoming."

# **Enrolling in Jewish Studies Courses**

Sales & Saxe (2005) found that 45% of all Jewish students had taken at least one Jewish Studies course by the time they become seniors in college. According to them "a fourth of those who were raised in non-Jewish or mixed households, of those who had minimal Jewish education growing up, and of those who consider themselves secular Jews find their way into these courses." Thirty-nine percent of our respondents reported taking a Jewish Studies class.

Enrolling in Jewish Studies courses does not appear to be as highly related to having had previous Jewish experiences (e.g., bar mitzvah) as attending Hillel which is engaged in almost exclusively by people with strong Jewish background.

#### Ben said:

I grew up Bahai with some Jewish identity and three pivotal experiences led to my feeling more Jewish over a period of time. First, a Holocaust survivor came to my school in early junior high year. This raised my Jewish consciousness and my curiosity about the world's definition of Jewishness. Second, I took classes after graduation at community college on the history of the Jewish people. This contributed to my awareness and insight. More classes followed. Third, when I was in LA, I met friends from religious Jewish families and shared a sense of community.

#### Personal Experiences

#### **External Characteristics and the Relationship to Being Jewish**

Several respondents remarked how they were identified by others according to their appearance and last name.

Keith feels a connection with Jews who are persecuted, "in part because people have told me I look Jewish—so it feels more personal, because I think someone could come at me that way."

Syd, who is more inclined to refer to himself as Jewish as he gets older, says: "Having my name (an obviously Jewish last name) and through my looks (Jewish features), having been characterized as Jewish, it's something pretty easy to embrace."

For some, a non-Jewish surname represented a palpable barrier to their being accepted as Jewish. Typically, this was based on a subjective belief rather than upon an actual exclusionary event. Sandra said she would like to join a synagogue in Chicago, but is uncomfortable doing so, because she worries that—due to her name—they will question her Jewish authenticity:

Name is a huge factor in my being accepted by the Jewish community. Joining a synagogue here and having to explain myself is very intimidating. Recently, my father was in town and we went to church together. I thought to myself how easy it was. Going to a synagogue would not be so easy.

Yvonne also has negative feelings about how accepting the Jewish community can be.

At times some people are very particular about how Jewish you are. People pick on my name, passed down from my father, for not being very Jewish. I don't think a name should be your identity.

## **Experience of Being a Minority**

Growing up in areas without many Jews served to heighten some respondents' Jewish identities.

Keith has nothing but positive feelings about being Jewish.

I know where I come from. I feel strong in who I am. Growing up in a town in which I didn't know any other Jewish kids, I saw being Jewish as something to be proud of. I was definitely a minority. Two of the entire school - the two being me and my sister. Being Jewish in such a non-Jewish environment was a bonus attribute I knew about that other people didn't have.

#### Phillip said:

I was one of only five Jewish kids in my school. My brother kind of ignored it, but for me it was frustrating that we were forced to sing Christmas songs. I refused to sing about Jesus in my French class. I don't have a Jewish last name and I don't look particularly Jewish, so I've heard more negative comments, which made me feel more Jewish. That is probably why I became president of my youth group. It was not this wonderful experience, but it was a place to be Jewish.

#### **Experience of Anti-Semitism**

Several respondents described how their Jewish identity and consciousness was enhanced by actual—or perceived—anti-Semitic experiences directed at them. (In the survey section, nearly 50% stated that "opposing anti-Semitism" is very important to them.) In addition, at the conclusion of the interview, when we inquired whether any important topic that touched on their Jewish identity or experience was omitted from the interview, quite a few said "anti-Semitism." Although we did not collect empirical information on the extent of actual anti-Semitic experiences among this population,

according to the 2002 NJPS report "Jewish College Students," this age group a reported a slightly higher frequency of such incidents than the Jewish population at large.

Joanna whose looks do not suggest her Jewish roots or her positive attitude about them is often asked about her identity, but when she worked on Wall Street, where it was "WASPY," and bigoted talk was common, she didn't bring up her Jewish background. When people view Jews in these negative ways, it makes her uncomfortable and more aware of anti-Semitism.

Darcy said a friend of hers in college was "shocked" to find out she was Jewish. At a later point, this same friend told her "he should have been able to tell by my nose." These anti-Semitic comments upset her and made her defensive.

Larry describes himself as "half Jew, half Okie." He didn't really become aware of himself as a Jew until anti-Semitic conflicts in high school, in which he was the victim of students who were "Nazi rednecks." They saw a menorah in his home and later called him a Jew, beat him up and threatened to burn his house down. "Everybody was there. Kids of all races stood around and nobody stuck up for me." He began to feel himself as an outsider in his community although later he thought he had been an outsider all along. Recently, Larry has become more interested in his Jewish roots.

1270 Broadway, Suite 609 New York, NY 10001 Tel: 212.760.1440 Fax: 212.760.1569 www.JOl.org

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> As previously indicated, the NJPS report on college students focused on people ages 18-29.

# **III. Major Themes & Conclusions**

## **Major Themes**

The following represents a distillation of the major themes that emerged from interviewing and surveying young adult children of intermarried families.

- 1. Continuity, rather than discontinuity, characterizes the Jewish identity of most young adult children of the intermarried. In terms of their religious identity, most of the people have remained on the same path as their parents. Nearly 70% of our respondents continued to identify with the type of religious upbringing which they received and nearly 75% expect that their Jewish identity will remain stable within the next 5-10 years. At the time of the interview, only a few respondents were actively engaged in "Jewish journeys." However, many stated that interest in exploring their roots and identity served as a major impetus for volunteering to be interviewed for the study.
- 2. Weak connections to the religious and ethnic dimensions of Jewish identity. Fewer than one-quarter of the respondents described themselves as "religious." When Jewish holidays are celebrated, the context is typically one devoid of religious content. Hanukkah, arguably the least "religious" Jewish holiday, is the most widely observed Jewish holiday among this cohort. Furthermore, there is little evidence that this population, in general, feels part of a larger Jewish community or feels connected to Jewish people around the world or in Israel.
- 3. Tolerance for inconsistency and for juggling multiple identities. Respondents embraced their dual identities and quite a few comfortably referred to themselves as "half and half." The majority of respondents continue to celebrate both Christian and Jewish holidays, such as Christmas and Passover Seders, though as opportunities for family and social gatherings rather than as religious experiences. The few who do relate to the religious aspect of Judaism often celebrate Jewish holidays with their non-Jewish partners. Respondents to this study also accepted the possibility that they would replicate their own upbringing; over 60% reported that "having a Jewish partner" was not important to them, yet nearly 80% said that they wanted to transmit some type of Jewish identity to their children.
- 4. Overall positive attitudes towards Jewish identity but minimal knowledge about Jewish content. Respondents expressed overall positive attitudes about their Jewish roots and particular pride in Jewish liberal values. However, they were generally ignorant regarding Jewish history and Jewish traditions.

- 5. Jewish knowledge derived from popular culture rather through Jewish education during childhood. Only a minority of this population received formal Jewish education when they grew up. Instead, their Jewish information and impressions were derived from popular entertainment—especially viewing "Schindler's List" and "Fiddler on the Roof." Significantly, these two lachrymose cultural experiences depict Jewish life as fragile and moribund rather than as dynamic and attractive.
- 6. Strong concern about anti-Semitism and interest in the Holocaust. Opposing anti-Semitism was one of the Jewish values most strongly endorsed by our respondents. It is possible that this view was related to actual or perceived anti-Semitic incidents which our respondents experienced as threats to their personal well-being. This population's interest in the Holocaust can be understood within the context of their cultural exposure to Holocaust-related themes and also possibly to their own extended family's Holocaust-era experiences.
- 7. Several major "Jewish points of contact" were identified for this population. During childhood, the bar/bat mitzvah represented the major point of contact between respondents and Jewish life. (Being raised by a Jewish mother, especially one that was strongly identified, greatly increased the chances of a person having a bar/bat mitzvah.) Having a bar/bat mitzvah was found to be strongly related to subsequent involvement with Jewish life and with current Jewish identity. However, we identified several Jewish experiences which provided opportunities for Jewish engagement to those who did not have a bar/bat mitzvah. These additional "points of contact" with Jewish life, comprised enrolling in Jewish Studies courses during college and attending Jewish cultural events during and/or subsequent to college. In addition, there is also some evidence that traveling to Israel served to increase the "Jewishness" of our respondents' social network. [This is consistent with the research findings on the impact of the 'birthright israel' program (Saxe, Kadushin et al, 2004).]

#### Conclusions

Through our research on people in their twenties who grew up with one Jewish and one non-Jewish parent, we were able to significantly expand what is known about this population's Jewish identity.

In our study, respondents' current Jewish identity as well as possible determinants of their current identify were studied by administering an interview as well as a closed-ended survey. We examined different patterns of Jewish identity and Jewish involvement for people who were raised in one of four situations; Jewish, half Jewish and half something else, Christian, or with no religion.

Although the interviewees were found to have very attenuated ties to the religious and ethnic dimensions of their Jewish identity, they share a positive regard for "Jewishness" and also engage in a wide variety of activities which they considered Jewish. The Jewish heritage of our respondents clearly has some strong staying power but what precisely that is may be highly individualized and contradictory. A surprising percentage of those claiming neither Jewish upbringing nor identity still find being Jewish important. They also observe Hanukah and attend Jewish cultural events as often as the Jewishly raised respondents. For many of those interviewed, Jewish cultural and Jewish family experiences are the threads that connect them to their Jewish roots.

Several formative experiences were related to the development of a strong Jewish identity. Some of these experiences, such as having a bar/bat mitzvah and receiving a Jewish education, are also associated with the development of Jewish identity among people growing up with two Jewish parents. However, other specific experiences and variables also played a key role in strengthening this population's Jewish identity including: having a strongly Jewishly identified mother, having a supportive non-Jewish parent, establishing a significant relationship with a Jewish grandparent, and experiencing anti-Semitism.

Most importantly, we identified several opportunities for people to compensate for the absence of previous Jewish experiences. Specifically, we found that enrolling in Jewish Studies classes, attending Jewish cultural activities (e.g., Jewish movies, films and museums), and also traveling to Israel (to some extent) are related to higher levels of Jewish identification even among those who lacked key Jewish experiences during childhood and adolescence. The success of these interventions demonstrate the potential for engaging people who did not grow up in Jewish homes.

Our findings do not support pessimists' worst fears that Jewishness has disappeared from the lives of this next generation. In fact, many of the key themes to emerge from this study are consistent with previous research (Phillips & Chertok, 2004; Phillips, 1993) in their documentation that intermarriage is not necessarily the end of the "Jewish road" for people who grew up in intermarried households. Despite disagreements about specific engagement strategies, there exists substantial consensus that any discussion about continuity—especially among this cohort—must take into account their diverse and increasingly complex forms of Jewish identity. As one respondent stated: "The large proportion of intermarriages in modern life has given rise to a new form of Jewish identity in which it is impossible to say 'I am completely Jewish'."

In this study, we have documented the substantial variations in current Jewish identities, experiences, and connections that characterize people who grew up with one Jewish parent. Going forward, it is the Jewish community's challenge to design initiatives to successfully re-ignite the dormant Jewish "sparks" which continue to reside within many of these individuals.

# IV. Recommendations from the Jewish Outreach Institute

Rabbi Kerry Olitzky, executive director, and Paul Golin, associate executive director

# 1. Positive Feelings About Being Jewish

## Finding:

- Nearly 70% of those interviewed for this research reported that "being Jewish" is either "somewhat" or "very" important to them, an almost identical proportion to that found in the NJPS for a comparable sample.
- Many respondents poignantly described their limited familiarity with "things Jewish" including Jewish history, Jewish culture and Jewish rituals.

# Training Implication:

- There is a potential spark of Jewish life within a large majority of the adult children of
  intermarriage. That fact alone must be driven home among Jewish communal
  leaders, who are used to relying on poorly explained statistics that suggest "only
  35% of intermarried families raise their children Jewish," which allows the community
  to write off the rest (or all) of the children of intermarriage.
- However, there is still a substantial gap between how Jewish these individuals "feel" and whether or not they participate in the organized Jewish community, in part because of awareness of their own lack of knowledge. The onus must be on the Jewish community to create lower-barrier entry points for the children of intermarriage; expand the definitions of (and opportunities for) having a "Jewish experience"; and reach people where they are rather than expect them to come to us.

#### Next Step:

Through **networking**, **training** and **technical assistance**, JOI can help Jewish communal professionals and lay leaders come to a fuller understanding of the target demographic, to show that we need not be so quick to write off this large and growing population, and to identify opportunities and methods for building upon the spark of Jewish identity within unaffiliated Jews in general and unaffiliated intermarried households in particular.

# 2. Comfort Level with Dual Identity

#### Finding:

- Our respondents expressed comfort with their dual identity.
- Many volunteered that they identified themselves as "half and half."
- They displayed a tolerance for inconsistency and contradiction; (64%) indicated that having a Jewish partner is not important to them while (78%) also expressed a desire to "transmit a Jewish ethnic identity to their children."

#### Training Implication:

- While this is admittedly a very complicated policy issue, if "half-Jewish" is a new and emerging identity—as this study and others have suggested—the organized Jewish community should consider programs catering specifically to such an identity, to simply share Jewish life and culture without being judgmental about other aspects of individual identities.
- If the organized community cannot officially sanction "half-Jewishness," perhaps programs can be supported that use proxies, such as peer group leaders who consider themselves "half-Jewish" but are also deeply engaged in Jewish life and can serve as a bridge for other "half-Jews" to learn more about their Jewish half.
- Those Jewish professionals and leaders who believe "you're either Jewish or your not" must *overcome* (though not necessarily change) their own understanding of Jewish identity if they want to effectively serve this growing population.

# Next Step:

The conversation must be started, despite the discomfort about it in much of the organized community. JOI's proposed training and networking will include at least one session on the challenges of "half-Jewishness."

#### 3. Awareness of Matrilineal Descent

# Finding:

- Despite their general lack of knowledge regarding Jewish laws and practices, respondents were cognizant that traditional Judaism considers only the offspring of Jewish mothers to be fully Jewish.
- Jewish people with whom they came into contact often reinforced this idea.
- While 64% of children with Jewish mothers had bar/bat mitzvah, only 37% of children with Jewish fathers had bar/bat mitzvahs.

#### Training Implication:

- There is a known corollary relationship between the mother in an intermarriage being Jewish and the child having a stronger Jewish education, but there is no provable causal reason for this. While in general women have maintained the primary role in educational decisions and workload (despite our liberated society), we also believe that pressures within the Jewish community about who's a "real" Jew contribute to discouraging unaffiliated, patrilineal families.
- The challenge is not just in addressing the children of intermarriage, but even more so in reaching affiliated Jews in general, to alert them to both the detrimental effects of judgment statements and the benefits of inviting the exploration of Jewish identity even among those who they may feel are not *yet* "real" Jews.

#### Next Step:

 The "Who's a Jew" debate is the single most divisive issue between the denominations, with no easy solution. But we must find some common ground in

- Page 46
- order to invite participation even among non-halachic Jews, or we are simply wasting precious time while an entire generation of potential Jews slips away.
- The institutions and movements that run programming not bound by the authority of halacha need help in better promoting their openness to the target audience.
   Technical assistance in marketing is part of JOI's training.
- "Outreach" to welcome disengaged Jews is a job for all engaged and semi-engaged Jews, not just Jewish professionals. The community needs to educate its "core" participants that words can push people away, but can also open more doors in.
   College campuses in particular would be a relevant place to begin such a dialog.

# 4. Significance of Having a Jewish Mother

# Finding:

- Only 45% of respondents with Jewish fathers as opposed to 77% of respondents with Jewish mothers indicated that their Jewish parent encouraged them to "identify with the Jewish religion."
- Mothers are more likely in charge of a child's education: 63% of children whose mothers encouraged them to identify Jewishly received some Jewish education, while this was true for only 35% of children whose fathers encouraged them to identify Jewishly.

# Training Implication:

- If we agree that it is mainly mothers driving religious educational decisions, and we also agree that Jewish intermarriage happens most often between two non-religious people, then the Jewish community needs to find ways to better welcome non-Jewish mothers and encourage them to raise Jewish children.
- In intermarriages where the father is Jewish, the community must reach out before and during the couple's child-rearing decision-making process, to show there is a place for them within the Jewish community and address whatever is preventing a larger percentage of those households from raising Jewish children (apathy, stigma about patrilineal descent, etc.).

#### Next Step:

- JOI runs a successful eight-month educational program for non-Jewish women raising Jewish children, and is currently compiling a curriculum for distribution among a network of Jewish professionals and leaders.
- JOI has proven that Jewish programming for families with young children in secular venues and public spaces can reach large numbers of unaffiliated, intermarried households. This "Public Space Judaism" model is a central component of our training and advocacy, to take Judaism out of its institutional walls to reach people where they are.

# 5. Grandparents Play an Important Role

## Finding:

- Grandparents played a pivotal role in determining many respondents' Jewish identities and in helping to instill a strong sense of culture and family history in their grandchildren.
- One such respondent illustrated, "My grandfather waited until I was around eleven or twelve, when I was able to comprehend it a little more. And even as he was an influence, it was not by pushing or preaching. He enjoyed his spirituality, and he showed me how important it was to be Jewish, and how to maintain it."

## Training Implication:

- While there are a handful of therapy-style discussion groups for the Jewish grandparents of children of intermarriage around the country, there are fewer actual Jewish activities specifically geared toward participation by grandparents together with their grandchildren. Grandparents can serve a bridge into deeper engagement, and the Jewish community can provide them with the tools to do so.
- If children of intermarriage receive their Jewish experiences through secular culture, emphasizing family research such as genealogy in general, to all young children, is one way to encourage a connection with their Jewish grandparents.

# Next Step:

"Grandparenting Interfaith Grandchildren" is a topic JOI has been exploring recently, with a just-published booklet by Jewish Lights Publishing of that title and a forthcoming book as well. JOI also piloted a program in Orlando called "Grandparents Connect," that can offer some insightful lessons to Jewish professionals and lay leaders receiving JOI training and technical assistance.

# 6. Cultural Rather than Religious Identity

## Finding:

- When asked to indicate their religion, only 30% indicated that they considered themselves to be "Jewish" by religion.
- While only 23% identified themselves as religious in outlook, 70% identified themselves as "spiritual."
- Nevertheless, a substantial number of respondents celebrate Jewish holidays; 64% celebrate Hanukkah, 45% attend a Seder, and 21% reported fasting on Yom Kippur.
- After lighting Hanukkah candles (65%), attending Jewish cultural events is the most popular "Jewish" activity engaged in (56%).
- Respondents who do not necessarily identify themselves as "Jewish" by religion also attend Jewish cultural events—although people who identify themselves as "Christian" are much less likely to do so.
- 85% claim that they "find themselves stopping to read articles relating to Jewish topics in newspapers or magazines."

#### Training Implication:

- Cultural Judaism is a lower-barrier entry point than religious Judaism. It is in the
  interest even of religious institutions to create more opportunities for more people to
  engage in Jewish cultural activities.
- The discrepancy between those who celebrate Jewish holidays and those who
  consider themselves religious shows that even Jewish holiday celebration is seen
  more as a cultural activity than religious.
- The majority who identify themselves as "spiritual" may be attracted to non-traditional forms of Judaism. It is the reason why (to the chagrin of most of the organized Jewish community) the Kabbalah Center is in business.
- Jewish rituals, such as Shabbat candle lighting, might be a suitable entry point for those who identify as "spiritual."
- If a majority of the adult children of intermarriage are attending Jewish cultural events, the Jewish community must do a better job collecting their names and offering relevant next steps.
- If Jewish news in secular media is reaching the unaffiliated children of intermarriage, the Jewish community must rely more heavily on secular media (make more news) and interject positive messages that will attract the unaffiliated in general and the children of intermarriage in particular.

## Next Step:

Name collection, follow-up, creating relevant next-steps, using secular media, developing personal relationships in order to help expand people's awareness of their Jewish identity and provide them with more paths along which to express it and people to experience it with: these are all aspects of JOI's "Outreach Methodology" that we've been promoting and refining for the last few years and that we now hope to bring to a large number of Jewish communal professionals and leaders.

# 7. Exposure to Popular "Jewish" Cultural

#### Finding:

- For many of these young people, Jewish history as filtered through a Hollywood or Broadway lens was their sole "Jewish experience" when growing up.
- A very large proportion of respondents mentioned two specific experiences: being taken to see "Fiddler on the Roof" and/or "Schindler's List."
- Respondents experienced them as "Jewish experiences."

#### Training Implication:

 Unaffiliated children of intermarriage receive Jewish information the same way as their non-Jewish Americans neighbors: though popular culture. Except that the children of intermarriage personalize it as a Jewish experience. Placing more Jewish themes in popular culture mean creating more Jewish "experiences" for the children of intermarriage.

- Partnerships and sponsorships with secular venues or media outlets presenting Jewishly themed popular culture can help the Jewish community better reach the target audience.
- Real-world programming is possible around Jewishly themed popular culture if it is well timed, relevant, and held in low-barrier venues.
- The community should try to place Jewish-themed culture in more arenas, such as insinuating Jewish films into college film programs, for example. That alone might deepen engagement, but it will be even more effective with a trained professional at the event making contact and offering relevant next steps.

## Next Step:

Forging secular partnerships is one of the methodologies used in JOI's "Public Space Judaism" model. Jewish institutions need to place Jewish culture much more "out there" and capitalize on the fact that Jews are overrepresented in popular culture. For example, during the phenomenon of Adam Sandler's Hanukkah Song, which received massive radio play, there may have been an opportunity for the Jewish community to run corresponding programs. We can build fun, creative first-step programming around something as simple as that, because it had resonance in both popular and Jewish culture.

## 8. Anti-Semitism and Holocaust

#### Finding:

- Over 80% currently believe that "opposing anti-Semitism" is somewhat or very important.
- Several respondents described how their Jewish consciousness was enhanced by actual or perceived anti-Semitic experiences directed at them.
- 53% stated that it is "very" or "extremely" important to them to keep people aware that the Holocaust took place. In many interviews the theme emerged as an essential component of our respondents' Jewish identity.

## Training Implication:

- Again, because unaffiliated children of intermarriage receive Jewish information the same way as their non-Jewish Americans neighbors—though popular culture—and one of the most common associations with Jews in the public eye is Holocaust education, it is not surprising that the issue is both resonant and personalized. Therefore, secular Holocaust educational programs and museums can serve as potential gateways into the Jewish community if effective partnerships are formed and joint programming created.
- The combination of Jewish pride with a lack of Jewish education and a real or perceived sense of anti-Semitic victimization, all within the same individual, can create confused and ambiguous feelings about one's Jewish identity. Awareness programs that want to reach this demographic can target programs for all people with wording like, "How Anyone Can Fight Anti-Semitism: Jews, Relatives of Jews,

- Friends of Jews, And All Americans," then identify those individuals through the outreach techniques of personal relationship building that JOI teaches.
- College level Jewish Studies classes dealing with the Holocaust and/or with anti-Semitism might attract this population.

## Next Step:

Through better networking across institutional lines, Jewish communal professionals can create partnerships around key issues to engage the target population. Holocaust education is challenging because it is a difficult to build a positive Jewish identity solely through the past tragedies of our people. However, if this is an entry point—and in some cases it may be the only entry point—then we must widen that path as we widen all other pathways into deeper Jewish engagement. And the triumphs of Jewish history should be taught alongside the tragedies, to raise an awareness of the flourishing Jewish life that is around us every day.

# 9. Weak Connection to Jewish People

#### Finding:

- Only 26% of the respondents reported that "the existence of the State of Israel is personally very important." (This was the lowest rating among several measures of Jewish connections.)
- Only slightly higher (31%) was their support for the notion that "protecting Jews in foreign lands from persecution is personally very important."
- These findings are not so surprising given that fewer than one in five (18%) of those interviewed had visited Israel.

#### Training Implication:

• It is simply logical that a group of people who are viewed with ambiguity by much of the Jewish community would return that ambiguity when asked. Again, the onus is on the Jewish community to first prove to these children of intermarriage that we care about them. Only then will they feel a part of the Jewish people.

#### Next Step:

Through JOI's detailed "scans" of over 300 Jewish institutions in various cities, we've found a remarkably high rate of insensitivity, whether purposely or unwittingly, among front-line personnel. Training front-line personnel in the sensitivities of outreach—to understand that not all Jews have two Jewish parents, or that not all Jews are white, or that not all Jews are Jewishly educated, etc.—has not been done to nearly the extent necessary. JOI's work with Jewish professionals emphasizes that "the front line is the bottom line" and we help transform their institutions to be more welcoming. Only after the Jewish community has welcomed in the children of intermarriage will they in turn feel fully responsible for the Jewish people.

# 10. Visiting Israel

## Finding:

- 18% of those interviewed had visited Israel. This proportion is somewhat higher than NJPS respondents (13%).
- Israel had a very positive impact on those who traveled there, especially for those who participated in an organized Israel trip.
- However, a closer examination revealed that Israel travel was significantly related to previous Jewish experiences, especially bar/bat mitzvah and Jewish education.

#### **Training Implication:**

• The obvious point is that Israel trips such as birthright israel are positive Jewish experiences for which the community should help recruit more children of intermarriage. The less obvious point is that it seems the current trip participants from intermarried households are mostly from among the already affiliated. This makes sense, because a commitment to leave the country for a week or more at a time is a fairly high barrier, not easily undertaken by someone who has little to no connection with their Jewish identity. Trip operators may want to better communicate the openness of the program to children of intermarriage.

# Next Step:

Through the "Public Space Judaism" model of outreach programming, JOI helps Jewish professionals understand how to move participants from one program to another, relevant next step. Inclusive trips to Israel definitely fit in the model, but it's important to understand *where* they fit, what leads into them, and what the next step is after the kids return home.

# 11. Experiences with Jewish Education

# Finding:

- Nearly one-third of those interviewed indicated that they received some formal Jewish education, though possibly for a very short time period.
- A larger percentage—37%—reported that they had enrolled in a Jewish Studies course in college.
- Of respondents who took Jewish Studies courses in college, the majority (59%) had no prior Jewish education.
- Of respondents with no prior Jewish education, more took Jewish Studies courses in college (33%) than attended a Hillel event (20%). This is also true of respondents who did have prior Jewish education: 48% took Jewish Studies courses compared to 41% who participated in a Hillel-sponsored event.

# **Training Implication:**

 Increasing both the quality and quantity of Jewish education provided to children of intermarriage is an important goal that may require a deeper examination of what is

- really available to such children and what kind of biases against them are built into even those institutions that purportedly welcome them.
- The large number of children from intermarriage taking college courses in Jewish Studies is another encouraging indicator that the spark of Jewish identity has not dimmed, even when they lack a deep prior engagement. That is especially important in light of the relative recent growth of such college courses.

## Next Step:

- Young adult children of intermarriage on college campuses may be more receptive
  to grappling with their Jewish identity than at any other time in their lives, so it is an
  opportunity the Jewish community must embrace, including but not limited to
  campus initiatives such as Hillel. An increased collaboration with Jewish Studies
  programs such as the Posen Foundation grant for "Judaism as a Culture" courses is
  one possible model.
- Attracting unaffiliated intermarried parents to send their young children to Jewish preschools, day schools, and/or after-school programs is a difficult sell. We again refer professionals to our "Public Space Judaism" model and our "Outreach Methodology" in order to understand the steps we recommend for a community to engage such parents in lower-barrier decisions first, so they see a welcoming community and create a home within it.

# 12. Importance of Bar/Bat Mitzvah

# Finding:

- Less than one-quarter of those interviewed had a bar/bat mitzvah when growing up.
- However, 90% of those who did currently consider themselves exclusively "Jewish" by religion, while this is true for only 13% of those who did not.
- 85% of those who had a bar/bat mitzvah compared with 61% who did not said that being Jewish was "somewhat "or "very" important" to them.

## Training Implication:

- Bar/bat mitzvah may be the pivotal indicator of Jewish religious identity in the adult children of intermarriage, even more so than having a Jewish education. If we assume that the Jewish education leading up to bar/bat mitzvah is in many cases not very strong, then it is the actual act of standing up in front family, friends, and community to declare oneself a Jew that is so powerful.
- Our goal should be to increase the number of children from intermarried households who undergo bar/bat mitzvah ceremonies. If it's the act of bar/bat mitzvah more than the education leading up to it that leaves the lasting identity, the community may want to offer some kind of acceleration program, for those 12-year-olds who didn't know about how "cool" bar mitzvahs were until they started going to them but find it too late to begin the process.

# Next Step:

For synagogue movements, the idea of accelerated bar/bat mitzvah programs is most likely not an option, because it is the central point of entry for too many Hebrew schools. The mandatory two or three year synagogue membership is sustenance, but it may also be a huge barrier for those children who, for various reasons, just want a bar/bat mitzvah. Originally, bar mitzvah marked the beginning of Jewish education, not the end (as it so often does today); perhaps there is a new structure the community can create, for those who are drawn in late but still want to have a bar/bat mitzvah when all their peers are celebrating them.

# 13. Regional Differences

## Finding:

- 56% of San Francisco respondents claimed that "being Jewish" was either "somewhat or very important" as compared to 74% of those in Chicago and 70% in Boston.
- San Francisco respondents are less likely to identify themselves as "Jewish" by religion.
- However, no differences were found regarding participation in Jewish cultural activities such as Jewish movies, museums, festivals etc. (San Francisco 53%, Boston and Chicago 57%).

## **Training Implication:**

Young adult children of intermarried households show a somewhat weaker connection to their Jewish heritage, potentially representing a trend in the West among Jews in general (as also found by other studies such as the NJPS 2000-2001 special report "Jews in the West"). Yet the draw to Jewish culture remains the same. This suggests that organized Jewish religion is what's not speaking to these young people. Jewish "spirituality" may prove a more fruitful engagement tool for the organized Jewish community in Western communities, as well as an expansion of the numbers being reached by Jewish cultural activities.

#### Next Step:

Jewish professionals and leaders need a better understanding how to move participants at Jewish cultural activities into deeper engagement with their Jewish identity, which in turn can strengthen Jewish communal involvement. Then they need to expand those cultural activities to serve as gateways for even more such individuals. Particularly in the West, communal professionals must explore the ways existing Jewish institutions respond to these new trends, to create and adapt innovative approaches to work with this population. Again, these are the goals addressed by JOI's outreach methodology, training, networking, and technical assistance.

#### References

Amiel, S. A Decade of Jewish Campus Service Corps. *Contact: The Journal of Jewish Life Network/Steinhardt Foundation*. Winter, 2005/Volume 7 Number 2, Winter, 2005.

Barack-Fishman, S. Double or Nothing .2004, Brandeis University Press.

Cohen, S. & Eisen, A. *The Jew Within; Self, Family and Community in America* Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 2000.

Cohen, S. Changing Conceptions of Jewish Collectivity Among Young Adult Jews and their Implications for Jewish Education: A Dual Research Project, 2002. The Jewish Agency for Israel.

Gans, H. Symbolic Ethnicity: the Future of Ethnic Groups and Culture in America," in *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 2 (January, 1979): 1-20.

Greenberg Quinlan Rosner Research. *OMG! How Generation Y is Redefining Faith in the iPod Era*. Report Produced for REBOOT, 2005.

Horowitz, B. Connectons and Journeys; Assessing Critical Opportunities for Enhancing Jewish Identity. A Report to the Commission on Jewish Identity and Renewal. UJA-Federation of New York, Continuity Commission, 2000.

Israel, S. American Jewish Public Activity – Identity, Demography, and the Institutional Challenge. *Jerusalem Letter/Viewpoints*. Jerusalem Center for Public Affairs. No. 462/September, 2001.

Keysar, A., Kosmin, B. & J. Scheckner, *The Next Generation.* 2000. The State University of Albany, New York.

Kosmin, B., *Mayer, E. & A. Keysar (2001). American Religious Identification Survey*, 2001. New York. The Graduate Center of the City University of New York

Mayer, E. Panel discussion organized by the National Foundation for Jewish Culture at the General Assembly of Council of Jewish Federation, 1992.

Mayer, E. Will the Grandchildren of Intermarriage be Jews? The Chances are Greater than You Think." *Moment* 19, no.2 (April 1994): 50-53, 78..

Phillips, Bruce. *Re-Examining Intermarriage Trends, Textures and Strategies*. New York: The American Jewish Committee and The Susan and David Wilstein Institute of Jewish Policy Studies, 1993.

Phillips, Bruce. <u>Catholic (and Protestant)</u> Israel; Non-Jews and Spouses and Children in Jewish Families. Draft: Paper; 2005. .

Phillips, Benjamin. & Chertok, F. *Jewish Identity among the Adult Children of Intermarriage: Event Horizon or Navigable Horizon?* Presented at the 36<sup>th</sup> Annual Conference of the Association for Jewish Studies. December 31, 2004, Chicago, Illinois.

Sales, A. & Saxe, L. Engaging the Intellect: Jewish Studies on the College Campus. Contact: The Journal of Jewish Life Network/Steinhardt Foundation. Winter, 2005/Volume 7 Number 2.

Sax, L. America's Jewish Freshmen: *Current Characteristics and Recent Trends Among Students Entering College.* Los Angeles: University of California Higher Education Research Institute. Hillel Foundation for Jewish Campus Life, 2002.

Saxe, L., Kadushin, C., Hecht, S., Rosen, M., Phillips, B. & S. Kellner. *Evaluating birthright Israel: Long-Term Impact and Recent Findings*. Brandeis University Cohen Center for Modern Jewish Studies, 2004.

Simon, C. The Role of the Supportive Non-Jewish Spouse in the Conservative/Masorti Movement. Federation of Jewish Men's Clubs, Inc., 2005.

United Jewish Communities (UJC). Strength, Challenge and Diversity in the American Jewish Population; The National Jewish Population Survey (NJPS) 2000-2001. Conducted by the United Jewish Communities (UJC). North American Jewish Data Bank at Brandeis University Cohen Center for Modern Jewish Studies.

United Jewish Communities (UJC). *Jewish College Students: A United Jewish Community Presentation of Findings to Hillel: the Foundation for Jewish Campus Life.* January, 2004.

Wuthnow, R. *Growing Up Religious: Christians and Jews and Their Journeys of Faith.* Boston: Beacon Press, 1999.

# **APPENDIX A**

# COMPARISONS OF KEY JEWISH CONNECTION VARIABLES

JOI 2005 STUDY DATA & NJPS SURVEY 2000-01 DATA

## Methodology

The 2005 JOI study focused on the Jewish connections of young adults with one Jewish parent. In order to place their responses and experiences in context, the responses of the JOI 2005 participants were compared with the responses of a similar one-Jewish parent group which had been interviewed for the 2000-01 National Jewish Population Survey (NJPS), as well as with the responses of young adult NJPS respondents who had two Jewish parents.

The National Jewish Population Survey included interviews with 4,523 Jewish respondents in 2000 and in 2001.<sup>a</sup> Among these interviews were 688 interviews with respondents between the ages of 22 and 30 (inclusive). Of these 688 interviews, sufficient data on 555 respondents existed to be able to determine if they had one (1) or two (2) Jewish parents — the majority of "missing information" respondents did not answer questions on the Jewish background on either of their parents, others provided information on one parent only,<sup>b</sup> and a few others reported that they "did not know."

There were 158 one-parent Jewish and 397 two-parent Jewish respondents between the ages of 22 and 30 (inclusive). These 555 respondents included all those considered to be **Jewish** or **Jewish-connected** in the NJPS 2000-01 data file, after the post-survey reanalysis by the NJPS authors and researchers. These concepts roughly correspond to the NJPS terminology of "stronger Jewish connections" and "less strong Jewish connections." The "Jewish "respondents were the base for the 4.3 million people NJPS estimate of Jews with "stronger connections," while the "Jewish-connected" respondents represented many of the additional 800,000 people that NJPS researchers considered to be Jewish, but with "less strong connections."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> See Strength, Challenge and Diversity in the American Jewish Population: National Jewish Population Survey 2000-01, A United Jewish Communities Report in cooperation with the Mandell L. Berman Institute – North American Jewish Data Bank, September 2003 (available on www.NJPS.org website), especially the Appendix discussion on methodology for an analysis of the 4,523 interviews which were labeled as Jewish after a post-survey reanalysis. An analysis of one-parent and two-parent respondents was published in an NJPS PowerPoint presentation, "Jewish College Students" (also available on website in Special Reports), but as the title suggests it primarily focused on college students, thereby reducing sample size considerably, eliminating significant numbers of respondents in their late 20s, and including younger respondents under the age of 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> Unlike other variables where missing information on one variable does not eliminate that "case"/interview from analysis, the cases without complete information could not be included, especially when there was information that there was one Jewish parent, but information was missing on the other parent, since the second parent could have been Jewish or non-Jewish.

In general, the "Jewish" respondents with stronger connections indicated that their religion was Jewish, or that they considered themselves Jewish. The "**Jewish-connected**" respondents with "less strong" connections typically did not view Judaism as their religion, and did not immediately indicate that they self-identified as Jewish.

But, following NJPS 1990 definitions, they were classified as "Jewish-connected" by NJPS researchers if they had a Jewish parent or parents, did not identify with another non-monotheistic religion or said that their religion was "none."

Both groups, to repeat, were considered to be part of the American Jewish community by the NJPS research and professional staff, and are part of the 5.4 million Jewish survey estimate.

Critically, there was an exceptionally strong linkage between the "Jewish" and "Jewish-connected" respondent classifications, and the number of Jewish parents they reported, although this was not the initial basis of the distinction.

- Of the 397 survey respondents ages 22-30 who had two Jewish parents, 98% were classified as "Jewish" in the NJPS data file, and only 2% were classified as "Jewish-connected."
- Of the 158 survey respondents ages 22-30 with one Jewish parent, 68% were labeled as Jewish by the NJPS research team, and 32% were labeled as Jewish-connected.

Thus, it is not surprising that the data presented in Table A1 comparing two-Jewish parent respondents from the NJPS 2000-01 study with one-Jewish parent NJPS respondents show strong differences in their level of Jewish connections, on almost every variable. Respondents with one Jewish parent are less connected than respondents with two Jewish parents. On a quantitative level, the impact of having only one Jewish parent is strong and measurable by the NJPS data — and provides meaningful context for the results and implications of the 2005 JOI study.

Table A1 presents data on key Jewish connection issues for three groups: (a) NJPS respondents ages 22-30 with two Jewish parents, (b) NJPS respondents with one-Jewish parent and (c) JOI 2005 study respondents, all of whom had only one Jewish parent. The comparisons among the three groups provides additional insight into the

1270 Broadway, Suite 609 New York, NY 10001 Tel: 212.760.1440 Fax: 212.760.1569 www.JOl.org

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> The details are much too complex for this brief discussion. Please see the Appendix to *Strength...*, and other methodological publications available on the NJPS website for a fascinating insight into the concept of what it means to be Jewish in contemporary America — empirically, as well as conceptually.

Jewish connections of Jews with only one-Jewish parent, and places the JOI 2005 study in appropriate context.

Some key decisions made by NJPS researchers (as well as the complexity of the NJPS questionnaire) resulted in some complications for the Table A1 comparisons. While most of the questions listed in Table A1 were asked in the NJPS study of both "Jewish" and "Jewish-connected" respondents, a number of questions were not — they were only asked of those with "stronger Jewish connections" — they were not asked of almost all NJPS respondents with "lesser Jewish connections."

For example, while the Seder and Chanukah questions were asked of all respondents — and thus allow meaningful comparisons in Table A1 — the Yom Kippur fasting question was only asked in the NJPS study of "Jewish" / "stronger Jewish connection" respondents. While some of these respondents had one Jewish parent and others had two parents, and the single-Jewish parent respondents were less likely to fast all day on Yom Kippur, comparisons on this question between the NJPS 2000-01 data and the JOI 2005 data would have been misleading.

Interestingly, Table A1 data shows that for several of these items asked only of the NJPS "stronger connected" sub-group — Hillel participation, Jewish studies course in college, the importance of being Jewish, views on whether being Jewish involves remembering the Holocaust / caring about Israel / countering anti-Semitism — the one-parent Jewish JOI Study group responses are very similar to the one Jewish-parent respondents from the NJPS study, even though those NJPS respondents had "stronger Jewish connections." <sup>a</sup>

1270 Broadway, Suite 609 New York, NY 10001 Tel: 212.760.1440 Fax: 212.760.1569 www.JOl.org

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup>The JOI 2005 study was conducted by Dr. Pearl Beck, Ph. D., who analyzed the qualitative data from the study, calculated the JOI 2005 quantitative data reported in Appendix Table A1, and outlined the topics for the NJPS data reanalysis, which was completed by Dr. Ron Miller expressly for this JOI study.

Table A1 Comparisons of JOI 2005 Study Data with NJPS 2000-01 Data: Jewish Connections of 22-30 Year Olds

Key Jewish Connections	NJPS Respondents: 22-30 Year Olds with 2 Jewish Parents <sup>a</sup>	NJPS Respondents: 22-30 Year Olds with 1 Jewish Parent <sup>a</sup>	JOI Study:22-30 Year Olds with 1 Jewish Parent <sup>b</sup>
Jewish Connections When Growing Up			
% Bar/Bat Mitzvah	70%	30%	27%
Males	79%	32%	23%
Females	60%	26%	29%
% Received Some Jewish Education	88%	48%	34%
% Attended a Jewish Sleep Away Camp	47%	13%	17%
Jewish Connections in Col	llege		
% Participated in Hillel <sup>c</sup>	45%*	28%*	29%
% Enrolled Jewish Studies Course in College <sup>c</sup>	46%*	30%*	39%
% Most/All Close Friends in College Were Jewish <sup>d</sup>	29%	6%	9%
% None/Some of Close Friends in College Jewish d	53%	86%	82%
Other Jewish Connections			
Ever Been to Israel	48%	12%	19%
Lights Chanukah Candles	84%	48%	64%
Attends Seder	78%	41%	45%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Based on 2000-01 NJPS definitions and includes all Jewish respondents ages 22-30 with complete information on both parents (N=158 one parent Jewish; N=397 two Jewish parents).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> Based on 82 interviews (8 people who identified as "Christian" were excluded from the JOI analyses).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>c</sup> Questions on Hillel participation and Jewish studies in NJPS were only asked of "stronger Jewish connection" respondents. The NJPS percentages are marked with an asterisk (following presentation patterns in NJPS publications) to indicate that the group answering the question included only those with "stronger Jewish connections." Thus, the similarity of answers by the one Jewish-parent respondents in NJPS with the JOI study one-parent Jewish participants is even more remarkable. The NJPS question on Jewish studies asked about Jewish subjects, such as Jewish history, Hebrew, or the Holocaust.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>d</sup> Categories were all, most, about half, some, none; "about half" answers have been eliminated to simplify presentation, but combined with most/all, and some/none would add to 100%.

Table A1 (cont'd) Comparisons of JOI 2005 Study Data with NJPS 2000-01 Data:

Jewish Connections of 22-30 Year Olds

Key Jewish Connections	NJPS Respondents: 22-30 Year Olds with 2 Jewish Parents	NJPS Respondents: 22-30 Year Olds with 1 Jewish Parent	JOI Study: 22-30 Year Olds with 1 Jewish Parent
Most/All of Current Close Friends Jewish <sup>e</sup>	39%	5%	9%
% Some/None of Current Close Friends Jewish <sup>e</sup>	45%	85%	70%
Being Jewish is Very or Somewhat Important <sup>f</sup>	87%*	73%*	67%
Attitudes Regarding Jewish Issues			
% Being Jewish Involves Remembering Holocaust "A Lot" <sup>f</sup>	72%*	60%*	53%
% Being Jewish Involves Caring Israel "A Lot" <sup>f</sup>	44%*	28%*	27%
% Being Jewish Involves Countering Anti-Semitism "A Lot" <sup>f</sup>	52%*	45%*	51%
Age / Marital Status of Respondents/Participants			
% Ages 22-25	48%	49%	50%
% Ages 26-30	52%	51%	50%
% Married	41%	26%	3%
% of <u>Married</u> Who Are Intermarried (Limited N)	20%	79%	81% <sup>g</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>e</sup> Again, the "half" of friends Jewish category was eliminated to simplify presentation, but combined with most/all and some/none equals 100%.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>f</sup> Questions on the importance to respondent of being Jewish, and the attitudes on Jewish issues (Holocaust, caring Israel, and countering anti-Semitism only asked in NJPS study of "stronger Jewish connection respondents;" thus, the similarity of answers by the one Jewish-parent respondents in NJPS with the JOI study one-parent Jewish participants is remarkable. The NJPS percentages are marked with an asterisk (following presentation patterns in NJPS publications) to indicate that the group included only consists of those with "stronger Jewish connections." The JOI questions were worded slightly differently than the NJPS questions, but the issues are sufficiently similar to be comparable.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> JOI data based on respondents who are married and those in committed relationships; NJPS data on married respondents only.